

What Does It Mean to Be a Citizen? A Comparative Study of Teachers' Conceptions in Spain and Chile

Rosendo Martínez-Rodríguez

<https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3816-0432>
Valladolid University, Spain
rosendo.martinez@uva.es

Carlos Muñoz-Labraña

<https://orcid.org/0000-0003-2044-1965>
University of Concepción, Chile
carlosem@udec.cl

María Sánchez-Agustí

<https://orcid.org/0000-0001-7163-3276>
Valladolid University, Spain
almagosa@sdcv.uva.es

Abstract

The aim of our research has been to analyse the conceptions of citizenship held by history teachers in secondary schools in Spain and Chile, while at the same time relating these to their perceptions of the socio-political and socio-economic contexts of their countries. The study compares the conceptions of teachers from these two countries which share a similar recent history and have both experienced strong movements of popular protest and political detachment. The methodology was qualitative and made use of semi-structured interviews. The study analysed dialogues from 70 teachers, 35 in each country. The initial results indicate a predominance of moral and participatory conceptions of citizenship, to the detriment of legal or identity-based conceptions. The controversial political, social and economic context of both countries within which the interviews were conducted is a key factor to understanding the teachers' perspectives on their conceptions and the meaning of these.

Keywords: teachers' conceptions; citizenship; citizenship education; history teaching

Introduction

In recent years, citizenship education has been growing in importance within democratic countries. Faced with the emergence of new social and educational challenges, such as globalisation, the information society, immigration, and political apathy, there has been a need to rethink the role of schools in the development of citizens. Consequently,



Education as Change
<https://upjournals.co.za/index.php/EAC>
Volume 23 | 2019 | #4209 | 24 pages

<https://doi.org/10.25159/1947-9417/4209>
ISSN 1947-9417 (Online)
© The Author(s) 2019



Published by the University of Johannesburg and Unisa Press. This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>)

citizenship education has formed a significant part of the curricula in most countries for a long time (Euridyce 2012; Martínez Guzmán and González Gutiérrez 2010).

As a result, we feel that it is important to explore the conceptions of citizenship held by the faculty members responsible for citizenship education. Here we define conceptions as the way in which teachers think about the concept of citizenship. This means to address the set of knowledge and beliefs that are essential to understanding citizenship, as well as the actions that ideally characterise a citizen. Therefore, this paper fits in the line of studies that deal with teachers' thinking as a way to better understand the way in which different subjects could be taught (Clark and Peterson 1986; Evans 1990; Levin 2015). We start from the basis that citizenship is a complex and ambiguous concept that can be understood in many different ways and that the way it is understood can condition the way it is taught (Lee and Fouts 2005; Veugelers 2011; Walkington and Wilkins 2000).

This study centres on a group of history teachers in Spain and Chile, two countries which share historical, socio-political and educational similarities. The connection between citizenship education and history is not a new one. History is a social discipline that aims to understand the past in relation to the present. The literature on the teaching of history usually places citizenship training as among one of the purposes of teaching history. In particular, the teaching of history concerns itself with the training of an active citizen who is able to critically decipher present problems and act accordingly (Martineau 2000; Rosa and Brescó 2017; Rösen 2005). However, citizenship education is not an inherent part of history teaching, but must be stated and planned by teachers depending on the citizen competencies they intend to teach in the classroom (Brett 2005; Haste and Bermudez 2017).

These conceptions can also be affected by the social, political, historical, and cultural contexts of each country (Gaventa 2002; Lee and Fouts 2005). In the cases of Spain and Chile, their historical and political contexts have very similar characteristics. Both countries have relatively young democracies, which have emerged through transitions from long dictatorships (1978 in Spain and 1989 in Chile, to be precise) and experienced rapid processes of democratisation and economic development that are currently being called into question (Garretón and Garretón 2010; Kovras 2014).

In addition, both countries have recently experienced important movements of citizen protest, in which criticism against the political model blends with other reasons for socio-political and socio-economic discontent (Fresno 2014; Jara 2014; Mateos and Penadés 2013). These precedents and the resulting contemporary situation, which we can describe as polemic, mean the issue we are concerned with has specific contextual features that must be acknowledged.

Our objective has been to analyse the conceptions of citizenship held by history teachers in secondary schools in Chile and Spain in relation to their perceptions of the political,

social, and economic context in which they live. The following research questions provided the focus for our study:

What conceptions of citizenship do history teachers in Spain and Chile have?

What differences and similarities exist between the conceptions of citizenship among teachers in these countries?

In what ways might their perception of their socio-economic and socio-political contexts affect the teachers' conceptions of citizenship?

Theoretical Framework

Conceptions of Citizenship

Defining the concept of citizenship is not an easy task and there are many alternative approaches. This is because citizenship is not a static concept but a contextual dynamic, a polemic and multidimensional concept (Schugurensky 2010). From a political perspective, the discussion about the conception of citizenship is normally divided into three traditions: individualistic liberal, communitarian, and civic republicanism, each offering the individual diverging views on their relationship with the state, institutions, and their community (Heater 2004; Mújica 2010; Oldfield 1998).

This paper deals with four possible dimensions of citizenship drawn from the educational field: citizenship as status (membership), citizenship as identity (feelings of belonging), citizenship as civic virtues (dispositions, values, and behaviours), and citizenship as agency (engagement, political efficacy, and power) (Kiwana 2005; Schugurensky 2010). Citizenship as status has its origin in the liberal conceptions of citizenship which consider citizenship as a legal condition of members of a political community (Heater 2004; Kiwana 2005; Oldfield 1998). Citizenship as identity, however, focuses on the feelings of belonging and worth in relation to a community; these feelings can be varied and complex as is the case with many multicultural or multi-ethnic countries (Schugurensky 2010). Citizenship as a civic virtue (as a moral conception) is no less complex because it alludes to the values and attitudes expected of good citizens without there being universal agreement on what these virtues are (patriotism, participation, critical thinking, etc.) (Kiwana 2005; Schugurensky 2010).

Finally, citizenship as agency (participatory conception) advances the idea of the citizen as a social actor—someone who uses their right to participate as much as possible (Kiwana 2005) by helping the community, volunteering, taking on leadership roles, or by encouraging profound changes based on critical perspectives (Schugurensky 2010). This type of citizenship has, in recent decades, undergone accelerated changes as a result of many new social and participatory movements where citizen protests and other forms of activism take on special importance (Haste, Bermudez, and Carretero 2017).

History Teachers' Conceptions of Citizenship

The literature gives an account of teachers' conceptions of citizenship education and the purpose of forming citizens rather than discussing the teachers' personal conceptions of citizenship itself (e.g. Chin and Barber 2010; Evans 2006; Lee and Fouts 2005). It has generally been accepted that it is useful to know teachers' conceptions in order to understand their performance in the classroom, but it has also been noted that what teachers do ultimately does not always reflect what they claim to do (Evans 2006; Osler 2011; Prior 2005).

Our research is not concerned with what teachers say they do in the classroom but with their conceptions, on a personal level, about what it means to be a citizen. Previous studies have produced diverse results on this issue. For example, the study by Lee and Fouts (2005) concerning teachers from Australia, England, and Hong Kong concluded that teachers attached great importance to the moral and ethical dimensions of citizenship. But further research in Australia, England, and the United States (Chin and Barber 2010) indicated that, although within different settings, teachers emphasised the importance of commitment and participation in all three citizenship contexts.

In the Netherlands, Leenders, Veugelers, and De Kat (2008) found that most teachers of social sciences (economics in this case) identified with aims for the critical formation of citizenship and that this was more common among older teachers. In Australia, meanwhile, Taylor pointed out that teachers tended to consider the most critical and participatory conceptions of citizenship as problematic in education, and that they preferred to promote actions commonly accepted by society (Taylor 2008).

It must be noted that some studies have detected a fluctuating character in the teachers' conceptions. This was the case in a study carried out in Colombia, where teachers fluctuated among legal, moral, or critical conceptions. Moreover, there were contradictions between their conceptions about citizen education and their conceptions about related terms, such as policy or participation (González Valencia 2013). Similar results are shown in another work on concepts of citizenship carried out in Peru, where teachers highlighted three elements of citizenship: the fulfilment of duties, the development of values, and the capacity of agency and participation (Barrantes, Luna, and Peña 2009).

Hardly any such studies in Spain exist, where the interest has been more focused on knowing the thoughts of teachers and students about citizenship in an intercultural and cosmopolitan sense (García Vélez 2012). However, in Chile there is more research similar to this study. In a study carried out in 2010, Chilean teachers' conceptions of citizenship ranged between liberal citizenship (based on norms, rights, and responsibilities) and a communitarian citizenship, with elements of belonging and participation (Flanagan Bórquez et al. 2010). Subsequently, in 2013, another research study pointed out that for teachers the idea of a "good citizen" was linked to respect for

norms (rights and responsibilities), certain forms of participation, and values such as tolerance, respect, and coexistence (Reyes et al. 2013).

More recently, the work of Cavieres Fernández and Muñoz Reyes has indicated that Chilean history teachers share a collective rather than individualistic conception of citizenship, together with a desire (that is not always fulfilled) to see active participation (Cavieres Fernández and Muñoz Reyes 2015). The same study also found that teachers related the student protest movement to the exercise of active citizenship (Cavieres Fernández and Muñoz Reyes 2015), which represents an important contextual conditioning factor.

Contextual Considerations in the Conception of Citizenship

As seen in the previous section, when characterising the conception of citizenship of an individual, each territory and time can produce different results. Citizenship, therefore, is a social construction and different contexts (political, social, economic, cultural, historical, geographic, or even linguistic) can produce different conceptions of citizenship or participation (Arthur 2002; Lee and Fouts 2005).

Historical, Socio-Political, and Economic Contexts in Chile and Spain

Spain and Chile share certain contextual similarities that have to be borne in mind. The two countries lived through long dictatorships and achieved their democratic status through peaceful processes of negotiated transition, but these transitions have become the focus of much discussion in recent times (Garretón and Garretón 2010; Kovras 2014).

The negotiations carried out in both countries involved the continuity of institutional and political elements of the dictatorships (such as the Constitution itself, in the case of Chile) and the renouncement of historical aspirations of the opposition (such as the prohibition to prosecute crimes in Spain and Chile as stipulated by laws of amnesty). In both countries these characteristics of the transitions have avoided violent rupture, but at the same time have influenced the resulting democratic models. Debates about the model of transition, linked to criticism about the current state of democracy, seem to have been instilled in the societies of both countries, and it is common to find these debates both in academic articles and in the media (Aceituno 2016; Ortiz 2011).

Another contextual element that brings together the realities of Chile and Spain is the growing processes of citizen mobilisation experienced in both countries. Since 2006 in the case of Chile and since 2011 for Spain, important participatory movements have been expressed through political rallies, demonstrations, and protests focused on a wide variety of educational, environmental, health, and social security issues (in Chile), and political and economic problems (in Spain) (Jara 2014; Mateos and Penadés 2013; Mayol 2012). Citizen participation through demonstrations and protests, but also through new forms of social organisation (especially online), seems to have overcome

the traditional model of participation, linked more to politics, during the first decades of democracy.

In spite of these similarities, the social, economic, and institutional realities of these two countries exhibit major differences. In Chile, the political and institutional disaffection seems to be linked to the need to improve the economy and the population's increasing expectations of the state; in this country, a new level of awareness among the population has given rise to demands for ever greater political participation, equity, and social justice (Jara 2014). Despite the fact that Chile is at the forefront of democratic indices in comparison to its neighbouring states, the distrust its citizens have in relation to the institutions of the state and the low levels of citizen participation leave its democracy in question (Garretón and Garretón 2010).

In Spain, the economic crisis the country has endured since 2007 has affected the labour market and social policies, which has led to a crisis of social cohesion (Laparra and Pérez 2012). In recent years, there has been a resurgence of protest movements against the policies and the actions of the traditional political institutions and parties (Fresno 2014). During the last few years pessimism has spread throughout Spanish society over economic conditions, and levels of dissatisfaction with politics and state institutions have been increasing, producing a detrimental effect on the quality indicators of democracy (Mateos and Penadés 2013).

Regarding the curricular treatment of citizenship education, both countries have experimented with citizenship as a subject. However, nowadays it is being treated as a cross-curricular subject as it is in other European and Latin American countries (Euridyce 2012; Martínez Guzmán and González Gutiérrez 2010). In the case of Chile there has been an increase in the debate regarding citizenship education in recent years. As a result of such debate an education plan to promote citizenship has been established, which is experiencing serious implementation problems. In fact, even though this plan considered the creation of a specific subject that would develop citizenship education, some years since the plan was formed much of the necessary agreement for its implementation is still lacking.

In terms of curriculum, it is the teachers of history and social sciences who have the largest share of objectives and content pertaining to citizenship education. Therefore, it can be said that history is the discipline that holds the greatest responsibility for citizenship education.

Methodology

As our objective was to investigate teachers' conceptions we decided to undertake primary research using qualitative interviews. Through the interviews we sought to analyse the teachers' conceptions of citizenship and their perceptions of the socio-economic and socio-political context in each country. The research was carried out

through a lengthy two-stage process. The initial interviews were held in Spain, and the same number of teachers was subsequently interviewed in Chile in order to carry out this comparative study.

Participants

In both countries the teachers interviewed were recruited voluntarily through contact networks and social networks used by teachers. The teachers had to have at least two years of teaching experience in the final levels of secondary education where the objectives and contents for citizenship training form part of the curriculum.

Teachers were recruited to deliver an equitable ratio between those from public, private, and jointly funded schools. An equal ratio of older to younger teachers was also sought, the logic being that younger teachers might have been more active in recent protest movements (Rojas 2012) and might have different conceptions of citizenship. Half of the teachers were under 45 years old and the other half were older. All participants were between 21 and 64 years of age. In total 70 teachers were interviewed, 35 in Spain and 35 in Chile.

Table 1: Characteristics of the sample

<i>Variable</i>	<i>Characteristics</i>	<i>Chile</i>	<i>Spain</i>
Educational centre	Public	20	20
Educational centre	Private and jointly funded schools	15	15
Age	Teachers older than 45 years old	17	17
Age	Teachers younger than 45 years old	18	18
Gender	Female	14	18
Gender	Male	21	17

The gender variable was not taken into account when selecting the sample, but it was during the analyses of the interviews, with 18 women in Spain and 14 in Chile included in the sample. Although disparities were looked for during the analysis process, there were no significant differences in the conceptualisation of citizenship observed between male and female teachers. Both genders presented similar discourse regarding citizenship and the socio-economic context of each country.

Geographically, the sample of teachers in Spain came from seven urban locations (Madrid, Barcelona, Valladolid, Murcia, Huelva, Bilbao, and Santiago de Compostela) with five teachers interviewed in each city. This geographic diversity was necessary to address the educational, curricular, and population differences between different regions

of Spain. In Chile, where there are no curricular differences among the regions of the country, the teachers interviewed came entirely from the Santiago Metropolitan Region which accounts for 40 per cent of the country's population. In Spain most of the teachers were history graduates and in 10 instances they had postgraduate degrees. In Chile the majority had qualifications in history teaching, which combines knowledge of history with pedagogy. In the Chilean sample six teachers had postgraduate degrees.

Prior to their participation all teachers were subject to an ethical protocol of informed consent, which confirmed that the data collected would remain confidential but may be published in anonymous form for research purposes.

Data Collection

Teachers' conceptions are traditionally sought through interviews as they provide greater depth from a smaller number of cases (e.g. Arthur 2002; Davies et al. 2004; Niens, O'Connor, and Smith 2013). The process of constructing the interviews was a lengthy one within the framework of both research projects, and included piloting and expert reviews in both countries. The final version was a semi-structured focused interview (Flick 2007) which incorporated a series of fixed items or questions whilst also allowing for deeper probing through conversation.

The interviews began with more general topics to generate a climate of confidence and then gradually moved on to the topics of most interest. The central questions of the interview were as follows: What does the concept of citizenship mean to you? What does it mean for you to be a citizen in the current political climate? What actions would you highlight that characterise a good citizen? Each question was explored through secondary questions, trying to capture the teachers' reflections. As a result, the interviews developed in the form of conversations that lasted between 35 and 45 minutes.

Analysis

The interviews were recorded, transcribed, and uploaded to the Atlas.ti qualitative analysis program. For the analysis we followed the process recommended by Kvale (2011) which involves the codification of meaning (assigning keywords to sections of the text), the condensation of meaning (summarising meanings to manageable formulations), and finally the interpretation of meaning. In the first phase, based on the reading and analysis of other research on teachers' conceptions of citizenship (Kiwani 2005; Schugurensky 2010), a theoretical framework was developed to code the data; its main categories included moral, participative, legal, and identity conceptions of citizenship (the latter generated no significant results between the teachers interviewed). In the second phase, multiple re-readings of the transcripts resulted in a number of sub-codes fundamentally based on the relations between the initial categories and influenced by the context of these categories (e.g. moral conceptions of citizenship included such sub-categories as the following: values associated with the conception; citizen action

associated with the conception; references to the socio-political context; references to the socio-economic context; connections between moral and legal citizenship; moral and participative citizenship connections). The use of the program Atlas.ti facilitated the grouping of codes into families, the interpretation of the contents of each code, and relating the codes to one another. Furthermore, a matrix of information was created for each teacher, such that a profile of their conception of citizenship could be established through the analysis of the different codes.

Each code and sub-code was assigned units of meaning from the interview transcripts in the form of words, phrases, or paragraphs. Some of these units will be given as examples during the presentation of the results. In some cases, the teacher interviewed held postulates of various conceptions of citizenship, but by means of a deeper analysis of these cases the evaluators agreed to identify these teachers with one of the main categories. In the results, we explain the similarities and the contrasts between teachers' conceptions.

Validity and Reliability

To avoid any bias in the selection of subjects, the participants were not informed of the content of the interview. It was only indicated that it was an interview of educational character, as part of a research project conducted by the University of Valladolid, in Spain, and the Andrés Bello University, in Chile. The interviewer made clear at the beginning of each interview that it would remain anonymous, that what was of interest were the interviewee's personal opinions and reflections, and that there were no right or wrong answers. The interviews took place in calm and relaxed environments (e.g. parks, cafes, etc.) without any work or time pressures. All of the interviews, both in Spain and in Chile, were carried out by the first author of this article.

The theoretical saturation of the information was achieved without problems before all the interviews were completed, so it was not necessary to widen the pre-established sample in either country. The analysis was undertaken by the researcher who conducted the interviews whilst another researcher was subsequently responsible for reviewing the transcripts to verify the consistency of the evaluations and to improve the reliability of the results.

Results

Teachers' Conceptions of Citizenship

The conceptions of the teachers could be grouped into three categories similar to those indicated in the theoretical framework (Kiwan 2005; Schugurensky 2010): moral conceptions (citizenship as dispositions, values, and behaviours), participatory conceptions (active citizenship, civil society, and commitment to change), and legal conceptions (citizenship as status and membership). In a very limited way only a few teachers expressed identity-based or global conceptions of citizenship. Unsurprisingly,

as citizenship is a multidimensional concept, teachers' reflections at times combined ideas of different types of citizenship, but we decided to classify their conceptions in one dimension or another based on the overall meaning of their discourse.

The coding used to identify teachers during the presentation of the results in this article includes the interview number (T + Number), the country (Ch / Sp), gender (M/F) and the subject's age (+/- 45).

Table 2 shows numerically the results of the teachers' conceptions of citizenship. While this is not the main focus or the aim of the research it can help with understanding the subsequent analysis of the qualitative results.

Table 2: Teachers' conceptions of citizenship

<i>Typology</i>	<i>Characteristics</i>	<i>Chile</i>	<i>Spain</i>
Moral conception	Citizenship as the civic behaviour of individuals and institutions. Values of coexistence, justice, and participation.	7	15
Participatory conception	Citizenship as active participation of individuals in civil society and politics.	20	10
Legal conception	Citizenship as rights and responsibilities established through the social contract between individuals and the state, renewed through formal participation.	6	9
Other conceptions	Identity-based conceptions and global conceptions of citizenship.	2	1

Moral Conceptions

We have grouped together as moral conceptions the statements of those teachers who understand citizenship, essentially, as a set of civic virtues, attitudes, and values, as the ideal parameters of behaviour of individuals and institutions in a society.

The conception of citizenship with such moral nuances was most prevalent in the discourse of teachers interviewed in Spain. For example, Teacher 29 points out that a citizen is “an individual who acquires values, acquires them through their family, in school and in life—things like tolerance, respect ... who puts themselves in the place of others and that help others live in peace in society” (T29/Sp/M/+45).

This represents a very generic concept which seems to stem in many cases from a feeling of unease that teachers express regarding the absence of any proper sense of social coexistence, respect, and solidarity towards others and towards public life. Teacher 6 says, “We live in a very selfish world and people have not assumed those responsibilities. For me, a citizen is an autonomous person, free, tolerant, open, and respectful of the rules” (T6/Sp//M/+45). This is similar to comments made by Teacher

30: “Being a citizen is to be aware of what’s happening in the environment in which you live and participating in the issues in your environment. But valuing participation, solidarity, tolerance, agreement, coexistence ...” (T30/ Sp/F/+45).

In Chile the moral concept of citizenship was also quite prevalent in the teachers’ discourse but not to the same degree as it was in Spain. Respect for others and for public life are the predominant values in this conception, which identifies citizenship with good coexistence. Chilean Teacher 29 says the following: “Being a citizen is about respect, respect for the other, respect for public spaces. It has to do with a sense of honesty and also with wanting the country to be better every day” (T29/Ch /M/-45).

Moral Citizenship and Socio-Economic Context

By connecting the socio-economic context, and the teachers’ references to and opinions on the socio-economic context to their conceptions of citizenship, we are able to better understand why the moral conception of citizenship is so important, especially in Spain. The controversial character of the socio-economic context, which we referred to in the theoretical framework, appeared throughout the discourses and the reflections of the teachers interviewed, either directly or indirectly. Talking about citizenship and, in particular, talking about citizenship in everyday life and highlighting the actions of a good citizen involved talking about the current socio-economic context and the experience of each person as a citizen within that context.

The opinions most critical of the socio-economic context were expressed primarily by teachers with a moral conception of citizenship. In Spain there was the perception, quite widespread among the teachers interviewed, that individualism, corruption, and dishonesty were factors that triggered the current economic crisis, lending a moral aspect to the conception of citizenship.

This feeling of disillusionment was sometimes directed at the representatives of power, as in the case of the following teacher: “Coming from this country I would say that the most important failing is honesty. But hey, referring to those we are referring to, well, they are still unpunished, right? Not only do they go unpunished but they get their power by evading taxes and by betraying the country” (T4/Sp/F/+45). In other cases, a generally critical and self-critical perception of citizenship is expressed. Teacher 17 from Spain (T17/Sp /M/+45) says the following:

I think what is happening to us nowadays is because we thought that we had everything sorted with our economic well-being, but now, of course, it’s very hard to emerge again as citizens. We must change our democratic rules a bit, which is not just to vote for some person and then forget about it; because citizens must show greater commitment. And that’s why, well, we are where we are now. Partly *mea culpa*, right?

In the case of teachers in Chile the strength of the moral conception appears to be linked to a deeper critique of the individualistic society which, in several cases, was connected

to the neo-liberal economic system inherited from the dictatorship (Novell 2016). A good example of this might be the following statement made by Teacher 1 (T1/Ch /M/-45):

We are still living the triumph of the dictatorship. You turn on the television and there it is. You hear a man making offensive comments to a woman and there it is. You see a woman or man who does not give up their seat to a pregnant woman in the underground, there it is. There is the dictatorship. There is the neo-liberalized citizen at his best, a totally individualistic type, who is interested in nothing more than himself and his own circumstance. So it seems to me that today the greatest act of citizenship we can show is to treat each other properly.

Participatory Conceptions

Within this conception the participatory actions of individuals predominate, not only through the formal method of participating in elections but through a wider range of actions. In some cases, the forms of participation that are expressed are close to some expressions of civic republicanism such as the desire (or a feeling of frustration) for participation and for control of institutions through direct actions that give individuals more freedom outside of representative systems (Skinner 2004).

The participative conception of citizenship was dominant among the teachers interviewed in Chile. This is the case, for example, for Teacher 5: “A citizen has to be very active, he must be able to ask and demand of the authorities that the country, the region, the communities, provinces, work better and he has to be active also in the workplace, and teachers have to be active with their students” (T5/Ch /F/-45). In general, participatory citizenship is linked to the idea of improvement and change in a society; according to Teacher 22, “For me the citizen is an entity, an agent, an actor for change and transformation” (T22 /Ch/M/-45).

In Spain, although the participatory conception had fewer proponents than the moral conception, it also had a very important presence among the interviewees. Some discourses were repeated in a similar way to those in Chile. For example, similar to Chilean Teacher 22, Spanish Teacher 33 says “I think of autonomous people, who think for themselves, who know their rights and duties and who are participants. Let them be participants, builders of their own history, their society, their country” (T33/Sp /F/-45).

In both contexts there was clear support for the most direct forms of participation possible. In many cases they incorporate nuances specific to local and community issues which illustrate, as we will see in the section dedicated to the context, a lack of connection to forms of political representation. This is the case with Spanish Teacher 14 when he says that a citizen should have the “possibility to participate directly in his society, in all spheres of society, the most directly and least representative as possible” (T14/Sp/M/+45).

Regarding the age variable, no differences were found, with parity between older and younger teachers concerning participatory conceptions of citizenship. Although we expected a greater inclination towards participatory conceptions from younger teachers (with their greater prominence in the social movements of both countries), older teachers also expressed their support for the participatory movements of recent years.

Participatory Citizenship and Socio-Political Context

In the case of teachers with participatory conceptions of citizenship, the most repeated contextual element was criticism of a socio-political nature, directed fundamentally to the political class and representative democracy. Even if the teacher regards having the power to vote as a positive aspect, disenchantment with politics emerges most of the time and other forms of participation appear to assume greater importance within the current socio-political context.

In Chile in particular, where the participatory conception was the predominant one, references were often made to forms of street participation, demonstrations, and popular movements in recent years, especially through student protests (Von Bülow and Bidegain Ponte 2017). Teacher 1, for example, warns that “from 2006 onwards there has been a positive process of social mobilisation in different areas of life. It first exploded in education and was expressed through a repertoire of tremendously creative events, forms of political participation not seen before: assemblies, sit-ins ...” (T1/Ch/M/-45).

In Spain as well, although to a lesser extent, references were made to participatory movements at street level, such as the “indignados” (outraged) or the 15-M protestors (15 May 2011 political protests) seen in Spain since 2011. This is mentioned by one teacher when she says the “movements of the ‘Indignados’ (outraged), from 15-M, are a bit like the resurgence of participation by the people after a long period of lethargy ... This resurgence of citizens and their concern for democracy is important” (T24/Sp/F/-45). But in general there were fewer of these types of statement made by teachers in Spain than by teachers in Chile.

The explanation for the different conceptions of participation between Chilean and Spanish teachers might be found in the different development of participatory movements in each country. In Spain, citizen participation reached a decisive point in 2011 through an explosion of demonstrations and mobilisations limited in time, which resulted in the appearance of new political parties and, finally, an increase in electoral participation. Conversely, in the case of Chile, the social movements, though they share the criticisms of institutions, political parties, and corruption, have been more constant in time and have always had concrete educational reforms as their principal focus. The massive student mobilisations of 2006 and 2011, as well as that of the teachers themselves in 2015, are examples of this and can help to explain the primacy of participatory conceptions among Chilean teachers. Moreover, in the case of Chile, there

has been no political channel for citizen dissatisfaction and electoral participation has fallen substantially in recent years, which is directly related to a greater lack of confidence in representative democracy among Chilean teachers.

Participatory Citizenship as Opposed to Legal or Moral Citizenship

Both Chilean and Spanish teachers expressed similar statements when discussing their disenchantment with the electoral process and democratic representation through traditional political parties. On this issue Spanish Teacher 24 (T24/Sp/F/-45) remarks,

Voting in elections depends on the degree of disenchantment or involvement that you find within that system. I personally think it gets a little more pointless each time, through the process of the loss of ideology seen today in both parties, right and left. So I do not feel that it's very important to vote sometimes because I see things stay very much the same.

Similarly, for example, a Chilean teacher declares the following: "Suffrage is important, to express a choice, but only when the candidates are true representatives of the people. But so far the political classes are all the same, things don't change, so I don't know if, when it comes to it, it's worth voting" (T24/Ch/M/-45).

In many cases, this desire for change in the political arena makes the participatory conception appear opposed to other forms of citizenship, such as moral or legal. For example, Teacher 2 points out that the moral conceptions of citizenship are outdated when she explains "before, it was like that vision of just being an honest person, but outwardly, I am a good person, I am a good citizen. But now the vision is different, to do nothing wrong is to do nothing, so the perception of citizenship is different, it's to do something" (T2/Ch/F/+45).

In most cases, the participatory conception of citizenship contrasts with the legal or liberal conception of citizenship, which is limited to the fulfilment of rights and responsibilities and to electoral participation. Teacher 11 says, "Citizenship has to do with living that citizenship, with making it practical. That is why I tell you that I do not understand citizenship as the legal possibility within the framework of reaching 18 years of age. A citizen is someone who participates, who is active, who gives their opinion, who is informed" (T11/Ch/F/-45).

Legal Conceptions

In legal conceptions citizenship is properly a status, a legal framework of rights and responsibilities. These conceptions emphasise individual rights and the social contract between the citizen and the state. The reflections that accompanied this type of conceptualisation include a more formal political meaning, possibly influenced by the traditional training of teachers. Nine Spanish and six Chilean teachers defined citizenship within these parameters.

For example, Spanish Teacher 12 defines citizenship from the perspective of political organisation: “We have common needs, we all contribute money, we meet these needs ... and since we are many, we need someone to manage things for us, and the only thing we demand is that they manage it well, period” (T12/Sp/F/-45). Citizenship, from this perspective, is the result of a legal framework that grants rights and obligations and which we use to organise our society. The origin of this conception starts from the idea of the social contract (Kiwan 2005), and several history teachers, using their academic education, mentioned this contract: “If we live in a system based on national sovereignty and if national sovereignty starts from the social contract of Rousseau, that is what I mean by citizenship. All of us citizens give up part of our power to create a social contract” (T19/Sp/M/-45).

This legal definition of citizenship does not contradict other conceptions such as moral citizenship. In some cases, teachers combined ideas from more than one category or started with a legal theoretical conception to which they then added values necessary for coexistence. The comments from Spanish Teacher 13 (T13/Sp/M/+45) typify this approach:

Citizenship is a legal concept of political content, citizens are subjects who have full political rights, no more no less ... If you want to give it a moral element you'd need to talk about those rights, which in turn generate obligations that are responsibilities for coexistence and which should be agreed on and which should be developed at school.

Age seems to be an important factor in this category since the four Chilean teachers who expressed legal conceptions of citizenship and most of the Spanish teachers were over 45 years of age. One explanation could be the training older teachers received and the influence of the curriculum, as the legal conception of citizenship had been the principal conception in educational curricula until relatively recently (Cox and García 2017).

Other Conceptions

In this category we refer to two conceptions that had very little presence in the discourse of the teachers in question: identity-based conceptions and global conceptions of citizenship. It is interesting to mention the scarce presence of conceptions regarding identitarian and nationalistic citizenship, particularly in a global context which by being linked to a migratory crisis seems to be giving rise to nationalistic and discriminatory discourses.

In our particular case it is believed that the scarce presence of identitarian and nationalistic conceptions among the history teachers is due to two reasons: the conflictive characteristics of recent Chilean and Spanish history and the professional profile of the history teachers themselves. Both countries are relatively new democracies that emerged after long periods of dictatorships, which generated a strong political division. This explains the fact that the features of national identity are weak and unstable and changing over time (Larraín 2010; Muñoz 2012). Within this context

it is only natural that history teachers feel compelled to adopt a neutral standing regarding history and citizenship, as well as having among the aims of their subject the development of students with the capacity for critical thinking and social responsibility (Martínez-Rodríguez, Muñoz-Labraña, and Sánchez-Agustí 2018).

Thus, we consider that the socio-historical context as well as the specific features of the professional area of history teaching could influence teachers' conceptions, even to the point of dismissing clearly identitarian conceptions of citizenship.

Conclusions and Discussion

Among the categories that emerged from the discourses, two categories clearly stood out: the moral conception of citizenship (more prevalent in Spain) and the participatory conception (more widespread in Chile). However, as has already been highlighted, teachers combined aspects of different conceptions in their reflections.

We find some interesting parallels with other international studies. For example, the study by Chin and Barber (2010) concludes that teachers in Australia, England, and the United States, although with different nuances, tend to emphasise the importance of commitment and participation. On the other hand, other international comparative studies have highlighted the moral and ethical dimension of citizenship (Davies et al. 2004; Lee and Fouts 2005). This trend towards participatory and moral conceptions of citizenship can also be perceived in Latin America. Some studies carried out in Colombia and Peru show that teachers are concerned about these issues (Barrantes, Luna, and Peña 2009; González Valencia 2013). Thus, as in our study, the participatory and moral dimensions of citizenship seem to be habitual concerns of teachers at an international level.

Our findings also coincide with those of other international studies regarding the fact that teachers did not give great importance to the identity or patriotic dimensions of citizenship (Chin and Barber 2010; Davies et al. 2004). However, in other studies carried out in very different socio-political contexts (such as the case of Singapore) the nationalist option seems to be more present in teachers' conceptions of citizenship (Sim 2008). As mentioned before, we consider that the poor presence of identitarian and nationalistic conceptions is due to the particular features of history teachers themselves but mainly to the controversial recent history of both countries. In Chile as in Spain there is still no majority consensus regarding national identity, mainly due to the recent dictatorships' nationalistic use of identitarian elements such as symbols, national festivities and important dates or common history.

There are interesting similarities between our results and those of other investigations in Chile. Like the teachers that participated in the study undertaken by Cavieres and Muñoz (2015), the teachers interviewed in our study also expressed their desire to participate more actively and directly in the democratic process. They also expressed

their appreciation of the recent student protest movements, which placed these teachers mainly within a participatory conception of citizenship. Previous studies, immersed in a socio-political context similar to the present one, also mentioned the existence of conceptions of citizenship based on values or morality as well as elements of participation (Reyes et al. 2013).

However, another older Chilean study by Flanagan Bórquez et al. in 2010 identified liberal or legal conceptions of citizenship, which were negligible in our study and have even been the target of direct attacks (for example against citizenship as a legal title or against electoral participation). Furthermore, that study also uncovered identity-based and communitarian discourses which did not appear in our results. These differences may be explained as a result of changes that have occurred since 2010 in the context of popular mobilisation and Chilean political disaffection that have evolved from the youthful mobilisation to the emergence of other protest groups (such as groups consisting of the teachers themselves).

In the case of Spain, since there is no previously published work on teachers' conceptions of citizenship, it is difficult to detect any evolution of teachers' views. The predominantly moral character of the Spanish teachers' conceptions of citizenship seems to have its direct origins in the background of the economic crisis, the continued appearance of cases of corruption, and the decline of the traditional political parties (Mateos and Penadés 2013). So, as it has been noted in other studies, socio-political and socio-economic contexts seem to strongly influence the thinking of teachers about citizenship, particularly when a controversial component is present (Arthur 2002; Lee and Fouts 2005).

In the cases of Spain and Chile, the studied teachers seem to react to the socio-political and socio-economic contexts with a desire for more direct participation and for positive values such as tolerance, honesty, and coexistence. But at the same time, it highlights a clear disinterest in some forms of democratic representation and in formal participation. The issue of political disaffection has been more widely studied with reference to students and the classroom (De Groot and Veugelers 2015; Muñoz-Labraña, Martínez-Rodríguez, and Muñoz-Grandón 2016), but it should also be considered in relation to teachers.

It is important to note that the variable related to the kind of school in which the teachers work (public, private, and jointly financed) did not show significant differences in our research. So, small-scale contexts do not seem to be more relevant in the conceptions of the teachers interviewed as they are more influenced by large-scale contextual issues that affect them all (political disenchantment, corruption, economic crisis, etc.) This result contrasts with studies on civic knowledge of students, where the school context has relevance, at least in Chile (Treviño et al. 2017).

Age, on the other hand, was a significant factor but only in that the few legal and identity-based conceptions that were expressed were given by teachers over 45 years of age. The scarce presence of legal and identity-based conceptions among the interviewed teachers is surprising. Perhaps this can be explained by the impact of the aforementioned contexts, worsened by institutional and political disenchantment.

In Chile as well as in Spain, the curricula of history and social sciences centre their aims for citizenship education on knowledge of the political institutions and formal democratic participation. But the results show that there are many teachers with profound doubts about these forms of democratic organisation and participation. The interviewed teachers are mostly professionals who are very involved in the socio-political context in which they live; they are worried about the social, political, and economic problems of their environment, and maintain an active and critical attitude. This includes their involvement in new methods of participation that have been identified by the literature as legal and illegal protests and as new forms of organisation, communication, and activism (Haste, Bermúdez, and Carretero 2017).

In general, the conceptions of the interviewed teachers seem to follow current trends—trends that promote a form citizenship that is increasingly participatory, autonomous, and critical (Cox and García 2017; Haste, Bermúdez, and Carretero 2017). Teachers' conceptions also agree in spirit with the philosophy of history education which does not seek to develop national identities, but instead seeks to develop skills that are crucial for becoming a critical and autonomous citizen (Rosa and Brescó 2017; Rösen 2005).

Obviously, all these results must be understood within the limits of this research, particularly because it is a qualitative study intending to delve into a number of cases connected by their contexts. Besides, the fact that teachers have one or any other conception does not mean that the different conceptions of citizenship that teachers hold directly translate into different practices of teaching in the classroom. As is well known, in practice many other factors interfere with the teaching process, such as the educational activities, the formal curriculum, the hidden curriculum, or even the educational and socio-economic contexts the teachers reside in (Evans 2006; Muñoz-Labraña, Martínez-Rodríguez, and Muñoz-Grandón Muñoz 2016). But we believe that the role of teachers is crucial in the citizen formation of students (Treviño et al. 2017), and that the teachers' conceptions of citizenship influence their approach and their focus in terms of the curriculum (Lee and Fouts 2005; Walkington and Wilkins 2000).

Having knowledge of the teachers' conceptions regarding citizenship is an important first step to delimit the positive as well as lacking aspects in citizenship formation education, which can help us improve the education of teachers on this subject. The next step must be to contrast these teachers' conceptions with their classroom practices and with their curricula.

References

- Aceituno, D. 2016. "La vía chilena a la democracia. Análisis crítico de la transición, el Chile reciente y su modelo." PhD diss., University of Salamanca.
- Arthur, L. 2002. "Precarious Relationships: Perceptions of Culture and Citizenship among Teachers of German." *Compare: A Journal of Comparative and International Education* 32 (1): 83–93. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057920120116544>.
- Barrantes, R., D. Luna, and J. Peña. 2009. "De las políticas a las aulas. Concepciones y prácticas de formación en ciudadanía en Huamanga y Abancay." In *Formación en ciudadanía en la escuela peruana Avances conceptuales y limitaciones en la práctica de aula*, edited by F. Reátegui, 19–95. Lima: idehpucp, Pontificai Universidad Católica de Perú.
- Brett, P. 2005. "Citizenship through History—What Is Good Practice?" *International Journal of Historical Teaching, Learning and Research* 5 (2): 10–26.
- Cavieres Fernández, E., and J. Muñoz Reyes. 2015. "Pensamiento de los profesores de historia acerca de la ciudadanía y la inclusión de las movilizaciones estudiantiles en su enseñanza [History Teachers' Thinking on Citizenship and the Inclusion of the Student Mobilizations into Their Teaching]." *Estudios Pedagógicos* 41 (2): 55–70. <https://doi.org/10.4067/S0718-07052015000200004>.
- Chin, K., and C. E. Barber. 2010. "A Multi-Dimensional Exploration of Teachers' Beliefs about Civic Education in Australia, England, and the United States." *Theory and Research in Social Education* 38 (3): 395–427. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00933104.2010.10473432>.
- Clark, C. M., and P. L. Peterson. 1986. "Teachers' Thought Processes." In *Handbook of Research on Teaching*, 3rd ed., edited by M. C Wittrock, 255–96. New York: Macmillan.
- Cox, C., and C. Garcia. 2017. "Evolution of Citizenship Education in Chile: Recent Curricula Compared." In *Civics and Citizenship: Theoretical Models and Experiences in Latin America*, edited by B. García-Cabrero, A. Sandoval-Hernández, E. Treviño-Villareal, S. D. Ferráns and M. G. P. Martínez, 85–104. Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.
- Davies, I., M. Fülöp, M. Hutchings, A. Ross, and M. Berkics. 2004. "Citizenship and Enterprise: Issues from an Investigation of Teachers' Perceptions in England and Hungary." *Comparative Education* 40 (3): 363–84. <https://doi.org/10.1080/0305006042000274845>.
- De Groot, I., and W. Veugelers. 2015. "Why We Need to Question the Democratic Engagement of Adolescents in Europe." *Journal of Social Science Education* 14 (4): 27–38.

- Euridyce. 2012. *Citizenship Education in Europe*. Brussels: European Commission. Accessed February 11, 2019. http://ec.europa.eu/citizenship/pdf/citizenship_education_in_europe_en.pdf.
- Evans, R. W. 1990. "Teachers' Conceptions of History Revisited: Ideology, Curriculum and Student Belief." *Theory and Research in Social Education* 18 (2): 101–38. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00933104.1990.10505608>.
- Evans, M. 2006. "Educating for Citizenship: What Teachers Say and What Teachers Do." *Canadian Journal of Education* 29 (2): 410–35. <https://doi.org/10.2307/20054170>.
- Flanagan Bórquez, A., G. Cerda González, D. Lagos González, and S. Riquelme Torrijos. 2010. "Tensiones y distensiones en torno a la ciudadanía y formación ciudadana: Comparación de los significados de profesores y estudiantes secundarios en la región de Valparaíso [Stresses and Strains on the Citizenship and Civic Education: Comparing the Meanings of Teachers and High School Students in Region of Valparaíso]." *Última Década* 18 (33): 115–37. <https://doi.org/10.4067/S0718-22362010000200007>.
- Flick, U. 2007. *Introducción a la investigación cualitativa*. Madrid: Morata.
- Fresno, J. M. 2014. *Participación, sociedad civil y ciudadanía. VII Informe sobre exclusión y desarrollo social en España*. Madrid: Fundación FOESSA.
- García Vélez, T. 2012. "Conceptions of Citizenship Secondary Teachers in Spain and Its Relationship with the Cosmopolitan Vision of Citizenship." York: Erasmus Academic Network, CiCe.
- Garretón, M. A., and R. Garretón. 2010. "La democracia incompleta en Chile: La realidad tras los rankings internacionales [Incomplete Democracy in Chile: Reality behind International Rankings]." *Revista de Ciencias Políticas* 30 (1): 115–48. <https://doi.org/10.4067/S0718-090X2010000100007>.
- Gaventa, J. 2002. "Exploring Citizenship, Participation and Accountability." *Institute of Development Studies Bulletin* 33 (2): 1–14. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1759-5436.2002.tb00020.x>.
- González Valencia, G. 2013. "La formación inicial del profesorado y la educación para la ciudadanía: representaciones sociales, diseño de clases y prácticas de enseñanza [Initial Teacher Training and Education for Citizenship: Social Representations, Design of Classes and Teaching Practices]." *Enseñanza de las Ciencias Sociales* 12: 37–45.
- Haste, H., and A. Bermúdez. 2017. "The Power of Story: Historical Narratives and the Construction of Civil Identity." In *Palgrave Handbook of Research in Historical Culture and Education*, edited by M. Carretero, S. Berger and M. Grever, 427–48. London: Palgrave Macmillan. https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-52908-4_23.

- Haste, H., A. Bermúdez, and M. Carretero. 2017. "Culture and Civic Competence; Widening the Scope of the Civic Domain." In *Civics and Citizenship: Theoretical Models and Experiences in Latin America*, edited by B. García-Cabrero, A. Sandoval-Hernández, E. Treviño-Villareal, S. D. Ferráns and M. G. P. Martínez, 3–16. Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.
- Heater, D. 2004. *A History of Education for Citizenship*. London: Routledge Falmer.
- Jara, C. 2014. "Democratic Legitimacy under Strain? Declining Political Support and Mass Demonstrations in Chile." *European Review of Latin American and Caribbean Studies* 97: 25–50. <https://doi.org/10.18352/erlacs.9794>.
- Kiwan, D. 2005. "Human Rights and Citizenship: An Unjustifiable Conflation?" *Journal of Philosophy of Education* 39 (1): 37–50. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0309-8249.2005.00418.x>.
- Kvale, S. 2011. *Las entrevistas en investigación cualitativa*. Madrid: Morata.
- Kovras, I. 2014. *Truth Recovery and Transitional Justice: Deferring Human Rights Issues*. New York: Routledge.
- Laparra, M., and B. Pérez. 2012. *Crisis y fractura social en Europa. Causas y efectos en España*. Colección Estudios Sociales No. 35. Barcelona: Obra Social La Caixa.
- Larraín, J. 2010. "Identidad chilena y el bicentenario." *Estudios Públicos* 120: 5–30.
- Lee, W. O., and J. T. Fouts. 2005. *Education for Social Citizenship: Perceptions of Teachers in the USA, Australia, England, Russia and China*. Aberdeen: Hong Kong University Press.
- Leenders, H., W. Veugelers, and E. De Kat. 2008. "Teachers' Views on Citizenship Education in Secondary Education in the Netherlands." *Cambridge Journal of Education* 38 (2): 155–70. <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057640802063106>.
- Levin, B. B. 2015. "Development of Teachers' Beliefs." In *International Handbook of Research on Teachers' Beliefs*, edited by H. Fives and M. G. Gill, 48–66. New York: Routledge.
- Martineau, R. 2000. "La pensée historique, une alternative réflexive précieuse pour l'éducation du citoyen." In *Pour une pensée réflexive en éducation*, edited by R. Pallascio and L. Lafortune, 281–309. Sainte-Foy: PUQ.
- Martínez Guzmán, G., and R. González Gutiérrez. 2010. *Informe Regional 2010. Evaluación de Programas Exitosos de Formación Ciudadana*. Bogotá: Sistema Regional de Evaluación y Desarrollo de Competencias Ciudadanas (SREDECC) and Banco Interamericano de Desarrollo (BID).

- Martínez-Rodríguez, R., C. Muñoz-Labraña, and M. Sánchez-Agustí. 2018. “Conocimientos y creencias del profesorado y su vínculo con las finalidades de la enseñanza de la historia reciente. La transición a la democracia en España como caso controvertido [Teacher Knowledge and Beliefs and Their Relationship with the Purpose of Teaching Recent History. The Transition to Democracy in Spain as a Controversial Case].” *Revista de Educación* 383: 10–35.
- Mateos, A., and A. Penadés. 2013. “España: crisis y recortes [Spain: Crisis and Cutouts].” *Revista de ciencia política* 33 (1): 161–83. <https://doi.org/10.4067/S0718-090X2013000100008>.
- Mayol A. 2012. *El derrumbe del modelo. La crisis de la economía de mercado en el Chile contemporáneo*. Santiago: LOM Ediciones.
- Mújica, P. 2010. *La igualdad Política: El significado actual de la participación ciudadana*. Santiago de Chile: RII Editores.
- Muñoz Mendoza, J. 2012. *La construcción política de la identidad española: ¿del nacionalcatolicismo al patriotismo democrático?* Madrid: Centro de Investigaciones Sociológicas (CIS).
- Muñoz-Labraña, C., R. Martínez-Rodríguez, and C. Muñoz-Grandón. 2016. “Percepciones del estudiantado sobre la política, los partidos políticos y las personas dedicadas a la política al finalizar la educación secundaria en Chile [Perceptions of Students about Politics, Political Parties and Individuals Devoted to Politics when Ending High School Education in Chile].” *Revista Electrónica Educare* 20 (1): 1–16. <http://doi.org/10.15359/ree.20-1.17>.
- Niens, U., U. O’Connor, and A. Smith. 2013. “Citizenship Education in Divided Societies: Teachers’ Perspectives in Northern Ireland.” *Citizenship Studies* 17 (1): 128–41. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13621025.2012.716214>.
- Novelli, M. 2016. “Capital, Inequality and Education in Conflict-Affected Contexts.” *British Journal of Sociology of Education* 37 (6): 848–60. <https://doi.org/10.1080/01425692.2016.1165087>.
- Oldfield, M. 1998. “Citizenship and Community: Civic Republicanism and the Modern World.” In *The Citizenship Debate*, edited by G. Shafir, 75–93. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota.
- Osler, A. 2011. “Teacher Interpretations of Citizenship Education: National Identity, Cosmopolitan Ideals, and Political Realities.” *Journal of Curriculum Studies* 43 (1): 1–24. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00220272.2010.503245>.
- Ortiz Heras, M. 2011. “Nuevos y viejos discursos de la transición. La nostalgia del consenso.” *Historia Contemporánea* 44: 337–67.

- Prior, W. 2005. "Teachers' Perceptions of Citizenship in Australia." In *Education for Social Citizenship: Perceptions of Teachers in the USA, Australia, England, Russia and China*, edited by W. O. Lee and J. T. Fouts, 93–130. Aberdeen: Hong Kong University Press.
- Reyes, L., J. Campos, L. Osadón, and C. Muñoz. 2013. "El profesorado y su rol en la formación de los nuevos ciudadanos: desfases entre las comprensiones, las actuaciones y las expectativas [Teachers and Their Role in the Formation of Citizens: Discrepancies between Understandings, Practices and Expectations]." *Estudios Pedagógicos* 39 (1): 217–37. <https://doi.org/10.4067/S0718-07052013000100013>.
- Rojas, J. 2012. *Sociedad bloqueada*. Santiago: RIL Editores.
- Rosa, A., and I. Brescó. 2017. "What to Teach in History Education When the Social Pact Shakes?" In *Palgrave Handbook of Research in Historical Culture and Education*, edited by M. Carretero, S. Berger, and M. Grever, 413–27. London: Palgrave Macmillan. https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-52908-4_22.
- Rüsen, J. 2005. *History: Narration, Interpretation, Orientation*. New York: Berghahn.
- Schugurensky, D. 2010. "Citizenship Learning for and through Participatory Democracy." In *Learning Citizenship by Practicing Democracy: International Initiatives and Perspectives*, edited by E. Pinnington and D. Schugurensky, 1–15. Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing.
- Sim, J. B.-Y. 2008. "What Does Citizenship Mean? Social Studies Teachers' Understandings of Citizenship in Singapore Schools." *Educational Review* 60 (3): 253–66. <https://doi.org/10.1080/00131910802195836>.
- Skinner, Q. 2004. "Las paradojas de la libertad política." In *Nuevas ideas republicanas. Autogobierno y Libertad*, edited by F. Ovejero, J. L. Martí and R. Gargarella, 91–114. Barcelona: Paidós.
- Taylor, R. 2008. "Teachers' Conflicting Responses to Change: An Evaluation of the Implementation of Senior Social Studies for the NCEA 2002–2006." PhD diss., Massey University.
- Treviño, E., C. Béjares, C. Villalobos, and E. Naranjo. 2017. "Building Citizenship in the Schools of Chile, Colombia and Mexico." In *Civics and Citizenship: Theoretical Models and Experiences in Latin America*, edited by B. García-Cabrero, A. Sandoval-Hernández, E. Treviño-Villareal, S. D. Ferrás and M. G. P. Martínez, 105–25. Rotterdam: Sense Publishers.
- Veugelers, W. 2011. "Teoría y práctica de la Educación para la Ciudadanía. Política, ciencia y educación en los Países Bajos [Theory and Practice of Citizenship Education. The Case of Policy, Science and Education in the Netherlands]." *Revista de Educación*, No. Extraordinario de 2011, 209–24. Accessed February 11, 2019. http://www.revistaeducacion.mec.es/re2011/re2011_10.pdf.

Von Bülow, M., and G. Bidegain Ponte. 2017. "Se necesitan dos para bailar tango: Estudiantes, partidos políticos y protesta en Chile, 2005–2013." In *Movimientos Sociales en América Latina: Perspectivas, Tendencias y Casos*, edited by P. Almeida and A. Cordero Ulate, 314–42. Buenos Aires: CLACSO.

Walkington, H., and C. Wilkins. 2000. "Education for Critical Citizenship: The Impact of Teachers' Worldview on Classroom Practice in the Teaching of Values." *The School Field* 11 (1): 59–78.