|  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- |
|  | Reviewer: 1 |  |
|  |  |  |
|  | Comments to the Author |  |
|  | Equal Education has become an important organisation and a paper on this organisation is welcome. The strongest part of this work is the interviews. |  |
|  |  |  |
| 1 | However the theoretical part of this paper doesn't break any new ground and offers little value to the readers. For instance the distinction between 'old' and 'new' movements has been rehashed on many occasions. The authors would do well to try and generate a more original and interesting theoretical position. This reviewer is reluctant to prescribe a theoretical paradigm but would like to encourage the authors to try and generate something a little more interesting and original. Perhaps an examination of the novel form - pioneered by TAC - of an NGO with popular support operating in the civil society space could be interesting. | The section on old and new has been removed. We now focus on the new debate about ‘slow activism’ and ‘learning power’. This is reflected in both the introduction and the theoretical considerations. |
|  |  |  |
| 2 | There are also a few small issues. It is a little odd to posit Hargreaves as having an original insight about movements winning gains on the terrain of education insight when struggles around education go back well into the 19th century. This is strikingly ahistorical. | While we agree that Hargreaves comments are probably not completely original, they provide a very useful foil that succinctly summaries one particular strand in the Education Change field. We tried to provide a better historical grounding particularly for the current period. |
|  |  |  |
| 3 | The idea that movements are not driven by markets and states is applied too uncritically. Equal Education has donors and, in part, an NGO form. The donors needs to be noted and some sort of sense needs to be made of the NGO form and its location in civil society. Are some of these donors from the market? Or states? Is action in civil society to inherently, as Marx suggested, to accept the rule of the market an the state? Or is outdated dogma? | We think that this is a very interesting issue, but to pursue it might distract from the core argument that is being developed in the paper. |
|  |  |  |
|  | Khayelitsha should be described as 'largely working class and Xhosa speaking' as not everyone living there is either working class or Xhosa speaking. | Done. |
|  |  |  |
|  | It would seem to be wise to cite Mandisi Mbali's book on TAC - its absence here is striking. | Done |
|  |  |  |
|  | The quick comparative points on other modes of struggle needs to be clear that this is not just a matter of different strategies - that EE has resources and infrastructure that are simply not available to most poor people's organisations and struggles. | Point taken. |
|  |  |  |
|  | The description of a grandmother's open and progressive values as 'surprising' should either be clearly attributed to an interviewee or, if this is the author's framing, be dropped altogether. If it is the authors' term it reveal more about their prejudices than the social reality they are describing. | We have address this criticism.  |
|  |  |  |
|  | Finally there needs to be some reflection on what kind of systemic impact EE is having in view of the fact that the education system seems to be stuck in an entrenched crisis. | We are reluctant to go too far down this road as it is not really the core focus of the paper. |
|  |  |  |
|  | Reviewer: 2 |  |
|  |  |  |
|  | Comments to the Author |  |
|  | If you are to revise this at all it would be interesting to see how the relationship between the students works - how to those involved view those who are not involved? Is there a hierarchy based on this moral high ground between those that work for the change and those who benefit? What are some of the tensions between the students and the University students as the latter now occupy a privileged space. How do the students stay motivated and what are some of the pitfalls and tensions in this kind of activism? Has this work had any spill over into the youth structures of the political parties? Is it really all as easy and supportive as you suggest? | Again we think that these are important issues, and we plan to address them in a new round of interviews. That said, we don’t have sufficient evidence to develop meaning insights about these with the data we have collected. |