

Teaching Citizenship Education in Ghana Basic Schools: The Quest to Achieve Patriotism and Democracy

Ruth Donkoh

<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-3213-4551>
Zhengzhou University, China
ruth.donkoh@yahoo.com

Wing On Lee

<https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8520-187X>
Singapore University of Social Sciences
wlee@ial.edu.sg

Josephine Donkor

<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-5879-1285>
OLEA M&G Insurance Brokers, Ghana
josephinedonkor1288@yahoo.com

Abstract

In Ghana, citizenship education aims to inculcate in pupils the behaviours, values and attitudes that enhance democracy and patriotism to produce efficient global citizens. However, Ghana is confronted with numerous social vices and atrocities due to pseudo-citizens who suppress the achievement of the country's citizenship education objectives. Moreover, the reasons why citizenship education has not been able to achieve its objectives are unfounded. Using John Rawls' theory for civic education, this study sought to identify the reasons for teaching citizenship education; assess if the teaching of citizenship education has achieved its objectives; identify the challenges that militate against the teaching of citizenship education; and identify the strategies that need to be adopted to improve the teaching of citizenship education. A triangulation mixed-methods approach was adopted. Quantitatively, 456 teachers from 72 schools participated in a questionnaire survey. Qualitatively, eight teachers participated in a semi-structured interview. In addition, there was a content analysis of the citizenship education syllabus objectives and the National Commission for Civic Education (NCCE) objectives. The results revealed that teaching citizenship education can help promote democracy and patriotism, but the objectives of teaching citizenship education are yet to be achieved. Moreover, challenges, such as a lack of trained teachers to teach citizenship education lessons and teaching-learning materials, militate against teaching citizenship education. However, it was found that providing specially trained



International Journal of Educational Development in Africa
#12221 | 25 pages

<https://doi.org/10.25159/2312-3540/12221>
ISSN 2312-3540 (Online)
© The Author(s) 2024



Published by Unisa Press. This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>)

teachers to teach citizenship education could salvage the situation. Moreover, it is recommended that the government, non-governmental organisations (NGOs), development partners, and volunteers should provide resources for the NCCE and institutions and assign specially trained teachers to teach citizenship education lessons in schools. Furthermore, the citizenship education syllabus needs to elaborate on the social vices in society to nurture citizens of noble character for posterity.

Keywords: Ghana basic schools; citizenship education; National Commission for Civic Education; primary school curriculum; democracy; patriotism

Introduction

Since the late 1980s, nations across the globe have voiced great concern about involving youngsters in patriotic and democratic citizenship. Governments, educational stakeholders, community leaders, and civil organisations have also shown their concerns by emphasising the importance of developing youngsters' civic knowledge to nurture them for effective citizenship (Tawil 2013; UN 2012). Citizenship education is a form of education that inculcates in pupils the desired skills, rights, knowledge and attitudes to enhance their performance of duties as patriotic and democratic citizens of the nation.

In Ghana, citizenship education has been taught as a core subject in primary schools since 1972. Its name has been changed since its inception in the primary school curriculum from "civic studies" to "social studies" and "environmental studies" to "citizenship education." It aims to nurture citizens who will be concerned, reflect, compete, and participate in the nation's development in the spirit of democracy and patriotism (Adams, Andoh and Quarshie 2013). It also aims to inculcate in pupils the habit and character of morality, truth, good virtues, and responsibility and to help pupils appreciate their expected duty to contribute their quota as democratic and patriotic citizens of Ghana.

Unfortunately, Ghana seems to possess so-called "pseudo-citizens", who practise corruption, disloyal aberrations, rent-seeking activities, and sole sourcing in the public sector. This has left the nation with a Nash equilibrium and aggravated the wounds of Ghana's forefathers (Congressional Research Service 2023). The "pseudo-citizens" who are hitting the country presently have caused the citizens to dump their immense pride in the cultural heritage of mother Ghana (Congressional Research Service 2023). However, the quest to obtain democracy and patriotism in Ghana has caused some citizens to express their poignant feelings and voice vigorous debates; hence, the need for corrective measures; otherwise, Ghana's democracy and patriotism will continue to struggle for progress in nation-building (Manu-Osafo, Enoch and Asante 2021). Smail (2023) notes that citizenship education aims to create citizens committed to their national development, and teachers are key agents for nurturing and shaping their pupils to deepen their democracy and patriotism. However, Ghanaian society is challenged

with social vices, the citizenship education syllabus is ambiguous and does not contain knowledge of the current social vices in the country (Smail 2023).

Although the researchers have identified some challenges that militate against the teaching of citizenship education, there is a paucity of literature on the reasons for teaching citizenship education, an assessment of whether the teaching of citizenship education has achieved its objectives, and the strategies that need to be adopted to improve the teaching of citizenship education.

Kyei and Liyab's (2022) research on the reasons for teaching citizenship education assesses the objectives of teaching citizenship education. It identifies the strategies that need to be adopted to improve the teaching of citizenship education. Moreover, other essential challenges that militate against the teaching of citizenship education have been overlooked (Zengulaaru and Nyamekye 2022). The current study sought to fill these gaps. Theoretically, the study will enrich and complement the literature on the reasons for teaching citizenship education, the assessment of the citizenship education objectives, the challenges that militate against the teaching of citizenship education, and the strategies needed to improve the teaching of citizenship education. Practically, the study will help educational policymakers, curriculum developers, and the government revise Ghana's current citizenship education syllabus objectives. The following four research questions were addressed:

- RQ1: What are the reasons for teaching citizenship education?
- RQ2: Has the teaching of citizenship education achieved its objectives?
- RQ3: What are the challenges that militate against the teaching of citizenship education?
- RQ4: What strategies need to be adopted to improve the teaching of citizenship education?

The following sections will discuss the literature review, the materials and methods, the study's results, the discussion, and the conclusion.

Literature Review

Citizenship Education and the Pseudo-Patriots in Ghana Previously

In Ghana, our forefather, Osagyefo Doctor Kwame Nkrumah, and some others were martyrs whose toil gained Ghana independence and called for continuation by the present generation. Several patriotic songs were composed by national heroes, such as Arise Ghana Youth for Your Country by Jonathan Michael Teye Dosoo (RexDanquah 2021); the Ghana National Pledge "I promise on my honour ..." by Dr Philip Gbeho (GreenViews 2021); and some local songs, such as "*ma ɔman yi ho nhia wo*" and Ghana Nyigba, to educate the citizens to be selfless, committed, dedicated and hardworking (Ababio 2021). Also, during the yesteryears, the popular radio station Ghana Broadcasting Corporation used to play these songs in the morning (Anoff-Ntow 2016).

This caused many Ghanaians to have the nation at heart, influencing their thoughts and dealings at the workplace. Similarly, the National Commission for Civic Education (NCCE) introduced Citizenship Week in 2012, intending to help basic schools in Ghana inculcate in pupils the importance of citizenship (Oduro-Stewart 2021a; 2021b). During such weekly celebrations, resource personnel in key professions are invited to educate pupils on matters concerning patriotism, nationalism, protection of the environment, state property, the need to respect tradition, abstain from drug abuse, and illegal acts such as bribery and corruption, maintain decorum and decency in language, as well as to be self-disciplined in public and private life (NCCE 2014). The 1992 Constitution of the Republic of Ghana is also shared freely with the pupils to educate them on the content thereof. Moreover, during the inaugural speech by Ghanaian President Nana Addo Danquah Akuffo Addo in January 2017 at the Black Star Square, he stated, “I urge you to be citizens, not spectators; citizens, not subjects. Responsible citizens build our communities and our nation.” This was a humble plea for Ghanaians to be actively engaged in the development of the nation (Adubofuor 2019).

Challenges to Patriotism and Democracy in Present Ghana

At present the sense of patriotism bequeathed to Ghanaian society by her forefathers is immensely depleted by her politicians and public sector workers (UNODC 2022). Unfortunately, some of Ghana’s leaders have an appetite for corruption. This was confirmed by the 2016 and 2020 Corruption Perception Index, which scored Ghana 43 points for both years, showing that corruption is prevalent in Ghana (Adetula 2016). Some notable examples are the former government of the Mills-Mahama administration when Ghana experienced police recruitment scandals; the operational business suit scandal of \$72 in the Social Security and National Insurance Trust; the rebranding of buses deal; and the Wayome embezzlement of GHC 51million saga; that have left negative impressions in the memory of the citizenry (UNODC 2022). The present leaders loot the national purse to satisfy their interest at the expense of the public and do not regard the repercussions of their dubious acts on the nation (UNODC 2022).

Ghana currently suffers from flaws in its rule of law, judicial corruption, corrupt acts that saddle government performance, illiberal practices like monetised politics, political vigilantism, electoral violence, vote-buying, political violence, and lack of punishment for culprits who are politically connected (Freedom House 2021). The alarming rate of social vices has provided awareness of the need for Ghana’s education system to strengthen its citizenship education to be centred on supporting educational changes (Zengulaaru and Nyamekye 2022). This has also been emphasised in some Ghana newspapers (Boadu 2016; *Daily Graphic*, 16 November 2008; *Ghanaian Times*, 7 June 2009).

Challenges in the Teaching of Citizenship Education

Maira Levinson (as cited in Fidaoui 2022) reported on gaps in teaching citizenship education in the United States and other countries. Research conducted by Kezban

(2014) among citizenship education and human rights teachers in Grade 8 identified the gaps that led to students failing to meet the citizenship education and human rights education objectives, namely: (a) the absence of citizenship education and human rights environment in the classrooms and in the school; (b) the lessons are usually theoretical and lack practical components; (c) the lessons are disconnected from real-life situations; (d) teachers focus on the teacher-centred approach; (e) teachers refuse to realise that their students are young; (f) principals and teachers refuse to be role models; (g) the absence of a family environment to enhance democracy; and (h) the false information disseminated by the visual media. Due to these gaps, society has lacked civic attitude, knowledge, and participation in democracy and has boycotted their responsibilities to concentrate on their rights (Kezban 2014).

Theoretical Framework

Rawls' Theory for Civic Education

Few people have suggested that a perfect society can exist, but historically, it implies an allegiance to a just society, which conforms with John Rawls' theory for civic education (Morrison 1984). Rawls' theory is democratic, and according to him, citizenship education would continue to support a democratic society whose principles are focused on equality and liberty. Citizenship education is the unifying force for educational institutions to enforce democracy and a civic community (Morrison 1984). Rawls' theory is the basis for traditions and a model for society, especially for those who cherish fairness and justice, which have implications for citizenship education. According to Rawls' theory, citizenship education needs to be child-centred. Thus, an active discussion with the pupils will excite and arouse their interest to enhance their remembrance and understanding (Morrison 1984). Also, a sense of citizenship education needs to be continuous for the young and old, and that will permeate society.

Materials and Methods

A concurrent triangulation mixed-methods approach was used in the current research. Quantitatively, a descriptive survey was used to collect data, and qualitatively, a semi-structured interview was conducted, as well as a content analysis of the citizenship education syllabus and the objectives of the NCCE. These were done to identify the reasons for teaching citizenship education in basic schools in Ghana; assess if the teaching of citizenship education has been able to achieve its objectives; identify the challenges that militate against the successful teaching of citizenship education; and identify the strategies that are needed to improve the teaching of citizenship education.

Sampling Method

A convenient sampling technique was used to select the La-Nkwantanang District for the study. It is located in the Greater Accra Region, the capital city of Ghana, and is endowed with a cluster of government schools, making it suitable to represent Ghana. The schools were put into eight clusters, and simple random sampling (lottery approach)

was used to select nine primary schools from each cluster. In February 2021, the census method was used to purposely select upper primary teachers whose consent would inform the study because they teach citizenship education. The sample entailed 456 teachers from 72 of the 135 schools in the district. The respondents were asked to complete the questionnaire. The respondents' privacy and confidentiality were assured as well as that of the selected schools. Explanatory notes and instructions were given to direct the respondents, and they were given ample time to complete the questionnaire. The primary instrument for data collection was a questionnaire guide. The questionnaire was made up of four sections. Section A entailed the demographic variables of the respondents; section B entailed questions on the reasons for teaching citizenship education; section C entailed questions on the achievement of the objectives of teaching citizenship education; and section D required challenges that militate against the teaching of citizenship education. The data comprised 20 items and was analysed using descriptive statistics, mean and standard deviation using the Statistical Package for Social Sciences (SPSS) version 21. The respondents' responses were calculated and summed for percentages and frequencies within the ranges of "Strongly disagree", "Disagree", "Neutral", "Agree", and "Strongly agree", respectively.

A semi-structured interview was conducted with eight teachers whose consent would inform the study. One teacher from each clustered school was chosen for the study, and based on the opinion of Dworkin (2012), five to 50 participants in an interview were adequate. Four educational philosophers received and reviewed the interview guide and incorporated their decisions in the final interview guide. The interviews lasted between 47 and 52 minutes and were all conducted after school hours. Pseudonyms were used in place of the participants' real school names, and the abbreviations (T1, T2, ..., T8) were used to represent the eight teachers. The semi-structured interview concentrated on strategies that must be adopted to enhance the teaching of citizenship education. The responses obtained from the participants were recorded on tape and were later transcribed and analysed thematically. The study results were juxtaposed with the objectives in the citizenship education syllabus, which were then analysed.

Content analysis was used to analyse the objectives in the citizenship education syllabus and the objectives of the NCCE. An independent sample *t*-test was performed to find the mean and the standard deviation and assess whether there was a statistically significant difference between the male and female respondents.

Results

Content Analysis of the Citizenship Education Syllabus

According to the Ministry of Education, Science and Sports (MOESS 2007, 2), citizenship education was introduced into the upper primary curriculum to develop concerned, competent, and reflective citizens to contribute to the growth and development of Ghana in the spirit of patriotism and democracy. The curriculum has four broad themes, namely: the individual, responsibility, authority, and justice. Other

accompanying topics are hygiene, civics, social studies, democracy, religious and moral education, peace, unity, life skills, good governance, sustainable management of the environment, and human rights, which schools are expected to teach for the pupils' personal development. It also entails the child's civic responsibility, service rendering, and participation in the democratic community. Under the four major topics, the objectives are to help pupils acquire skills and values, understand themselves, exhibit acceptable attitudes, respect power and authority, develop a sense of voting, be truthful, virtuous, and honest, and apply the principles of fairness. The subject again discloses to the pupils contemporary issues that mar the growth and development of the nation. Ghana requires its citizens to acquire the values, skills and attitudes necessary to address societal challenges. In addition, the subject aims to help the pupils to appreciate basic values and concepts that enhance constitutional order and democratic community to help the pupils to uphold and defend Ghana's constitution at all times, develop critical thinking skills, and help to promote peace and unity in the society.

The primary school curriculum contains defined key concepts that pupils are expected to derive to enable them to be concerned, reflective, and guided in their life decision-making. It states that the mode of assessment for citizenship education should be practical (skills, social, attitude, intellectual, values) that are required for effective citizenship (MOESS 2007, 5).

Scope of Content of the Citizenship Education Syllabus

Table 1: The structure and organisation of the citizenship education syllabus

Primary 4	Primary 5	Primary 6
Section 1: The individual Unit 1: Knowing myself Unit 2: Relationships with each other	Section 1: The individual Unit 1: The individual, education, and work	Section 1: The individual Unit 1: Young people and nation building Unit 2: Preparing for life
Section 2: Responsibility Unit 1: Values and responsibilities in our community Unit 2: Our national symbols	Section 2: Responsibility Unit 1: Safety in our community Unit 2: One people, one nation Unit 3: Attitudes and responsibilities for nation building.	Section 2: Responsibility Unit 1: Sustainable management of the environment Unit 2: Avoiding waste at home, school, and work Unit 3: Domestic violence and conflict in the family
Section 3: Authority Unit 1: My community Unit 2: Skills for effective citizenship Unit 3: How my community is ruled Unit 4: How we are governed	Section 3: Authority Unit 1: Governance in Ghana Unit 2: How to become a democratic citizen	Section 3: Authority Unit 1: Ghana and her neighbours

Section 4: Justice Unit 1: Basic rights of human beings	Section 4: Justice Unit 1: Gender relations in the community Unit 2: Ethnicity and national development in Ghana	Section 4: Justice Unit 1: Peace-building and democratic living Unit 2: Social auditing
---	---	--

Source: MOESS (2007, 2)

The National Commission for Civic Education

The NCCE Act 452 of 1993 was established to help inculcate in Ghanaian citizens the culture of democracy through sensitisation and awareness creation. Research has confirmed that the NCCE has helped in promoting and strengthening democracy which has motivated several Ghanaians to demonstrate their civic rights and responsibilities through voting, communal labour, women empowerment in politics, and protection of children and the vulnerable in the society (NCCE 2014). According to Adubofuor (2019), the 1992 constitution of Ghana (Article 233) outlines the functions of the NCCE as follows:

- (a) to create and sustain within the society the awareness of the principles and objectives of this constitution as the fundamental law of the people of Ghana;
- (b) to educate and encourage the public to defend the constitution at all times against all forms of abuse and violation;
- (c) to formulate for the consideration of the Government, from time to time, programmes at the national, regional, and district levels aimed at realizing the objectives of this constitution;
- (d) to formulate, implement and oversee programmes intended to inculcate in the citizens of Ghana awareness of their civic responsibilities and an appreciation of their rights and obligations as free people; and
- (e) such other functions as Parliament may prescribe.

Data Analysis

Table 2: Descriptive statistics of respondents' demographic variables

Variables	Description	Frequency (N)	Percentage (%)
Gender	Male	330	72.4
	Female	126	27.6
Age (M = 33.5; SD = 2.01)	21–25	20	4.4
	26–35	220	48.2
	36–45	161	35.3
	46–55	50	11.0
	56–60	5	1.1
Highest qualification	Doctoral	45	9.9
	Master's	30	6.6
	Degree	285	62.5
	Diploma	76	16.7
	Teacher's Certificate 'A'	20	4.4

Notes:

Abbreviations: N = Frequency and % = Percentage

The data was analysed using descriptive statistics such as frequency and percentage.

Source: Field (2021)

Table 2 indicates that a total of 456 teachers were purposively sampled from 72 schools in La-Nkwantanang Municipal Education Directorate. The respondents were predominantly male teachers (72.4%; $n = 330$), while the females accounted for (27.6%; $n = 126$). There was an even distribution of the sample across age groups, with a mean age of 33.5 years (SD = 2.01) ranging from 21–60 years. Those with the highest number (48.2%; $n = 220$) were in the age bracket 26–35; followed by (35.3%; $n = 161$) which was the age bracket 36–45; the next was (11.0%; $n = 50$) who were between the ages of 46–55; then (4.4%; $n = 20$) were between the ages 21–25; and finally, (1.1%, $n = 5$) were between the ages of 56–60, respectively. In respect of the teachers' educational qualification, (9.9%; $n = 45$) had a doctoral degree; (6.6%; $n = 30$) had a master's degree; (62.5%; $n = 285$) had a bachelor's degree; (16.7%; $n = 76$) had a diploma; and (4.4%; $n = 20$) had a teachers' certificate "A", respectively. Teachers with a bachelor's degree formed the highest majority.

Research question 1: What are the reasons for teaching citizenship education?

Five items on the reasons for teaching citizenship education were descriptively analysed, and the results are presented in Table 3.

Table 3: Reasons for teaching citizenship education

Statement	SD	D	N	A	SA	Mean	SD
1. Citizenship education promotes patriotism and democracy.	5 (1.1%)	10 (2.2%)	5 (1.1%)	185 (40.6%)	251 (55.0%)	4.54	0.43
2. Citizenship education helps to acquire desired attitudes, character, values and skills.	–	–	30 (6.6%)	165 (36.2%)	261 (57.2%)		
3. Citizenship education helps to uphold and defend the nation's image.	5 (1.1%)	10 (2.2%)	15 (3.3%)	210 (46.1%)	216 (47.4%)		
4. Citizenship education helps to maintain our history and appreciate our forefathers' efforts to be emulated.	–	–	10 (2.2%)	225 (49.3%)	221 (48.5%)		
5. Citizenship education helps to protect national assets, and promote peace and unity in the society.	–	5 (1.1%)	15 (3.3%)	220 (48.2%)	216 (47.4%)		

Note: The data was analysed using descriptive statistics. A 5-point Likert scale was used.

Source: Field (2021)

Table 3 shows the questions used for assessing the reasons for teaching citizenship education with five questions using a 5-point Likert scale of “Strongly disagree”, “Disagree”, “Neutral”, “Agree” and “Strongly agree”. The responses Strongly agree and Agree were merged to Agree, and the responses Strongly disagree and Disagree were also merged to Disagree; however, the Neutral response was maintained. The total sum of the scores was provided for each respondent out of five possible points (mean score 1–5). The outcome of the results indicated a mean value of 4.54 (SD = 0.43) for the reasons for teaching citizenship education. The teachers' knowledge about awareness of teaching citizenship education was divided into three levels of awareness: low,

moderate and high. The cut-off point for low awareness was the 25th percentile (range 1.00–2.59); moderate awareness was determined by the 50th percentile (range 2.60–3.39); and high awareness was above the 75th percentile (range 3.40–5.00). The mean value of 4.54 (SD = 0.43) indicated that most respondents agreed with the five possible reasons for teaching citizenship education that the researchers provided. This implies that the teaching of citizenship education can help promote democracy, patriotism, desired attitude, and character, maintain Ghana's history, and emulate the good deeds of her forefathers. It can also protect national assets and promote peace and unity in society.

Relationship between Gender and the Study Variables

To provide additional insight into the respondents' gender and the study variables, the researchers assessed if there was a statistically significant difference between the male and female respondents. An independent sample *t*-test was performed to compare gender with the study variables. The results showed that the male values were ($M = 4.53$; $SD = 0.0.45$), whereas the female values were ($M = 4.54$; $SD = 0.0.35$); $t = (-2.4)$; $p = 0.09$. This implies no statistically significant difference between the male and female respondents.

Research question 2: Has the teaching of citizenship education achieved its objectives?

Five items were used to assess the achievement of the citizenship education objectives, which were descriptively analysed, and the results are presented in Table 4.

Table 4: Has teaching citizenship education achieved its objectives?

Statement	SD	D	N	A	SA	Mean	SD
6. Citizenship education has helped to achieve patriotism and democracy	120 (25.8%)	165 (35.5%)	65 (14.0%)	85 (18.3%)	30 (6.5%)	2.69	0.70
7. Citizenship education has helped to achieve the right character, attitude, values, and skills.	85 (18.3%)	180 (38.7%)	40 (8.6%)	130 (28.0%)	20 (4.3%)		
8. Citizenship education has helped society to uphold and defend the nation's image.	210 (45.2%)	120 (25.8%)	35 (7.5%)	65 (14.0%)	25 (5.4%)		
9. Citizenship education has helped to maintain the history and emulated our forefathers' efforts.	145 (31.2%)	165 (35.5%)	30 (6.5%)	90 (19.4%)	35 (7.5%)		
10. Citizenship education has helped to protect the nation's assets, promoted peace, and unity in the society.	280 (60.2%)	135 (29.0%)	—	25 (5.4%)	25 (5.4%)		

Note: The data was analysed using descriptive statistics. A 5-point Likert scale was used

Source: Field (2021)

Table 4 indicates the questions used for evaluating the achievement of the objectives for teaching citizenship education with five questions using a 5-point Likert scale of “Strongly disagree”, “Disagree”, “Neutral”, “Agree” and “Strongly agree”. The responses for Strongly agree and Agree were merged to Agree, and the responses for Strongly disagree and Disagree were also merged to Disagree; however, the Neutral response was maintained. The total sum of the scores was provided for each respondent out of five possible points (mean score 1–5). The outcome of the results indicated a mean value of 2.69 (SD = 0.70) for the achievement of teaching citizenship education. The teachers' knowledge about the achievement of teaching citizenship education was divided into three levels of awareness: low, moderate and high. The cut-off point for low awareness was the 25th percentile (range 1.00–2.59); moderate awareness was determined by the 50th percentile (range 2.60–3.39); and high awareness was above the 75th percentile (range 3.40–5.00). The mean value of 2.69 (SD = 0.70) indicated that

the respondents' responses were neutral to the five possible achievements of the objectives for teaching citizenship education that the researchers provided. This implies that the teaching of citizenship education had neither achieved nor not achieved its objectives.

Relationship between Gender and the Study Variables

To provide additional insight into the respondents' gender and the study variables, the researchers assessed if there was a statistically significant difference between the male and female respondents. An independent sample *t*-test was performed to compare gender with the study variables. The results showed male values were ($M = 2.66$, $SD = 0.69$), whereas the female values were ($M = 2.72$, $SD = 0.71$); $t = (-0.86)$; $p = 0.61$. This implies that there was no statistically significant difference between the male and female respondents.

Research question 3: What are the challenges that militate against the teaching of citizenship education?

Five items were used to identify some challenges that militate against teaching citizenship education. The responses to these questions were analysed by descriptive statistics, as indicated in Table 5.

Table 5: Challenges that militate against the teaching of citizenship education

Statement	SD	D	N	A	SA	Mean	SD
11. Educational stakeholders give little attention to citizenship education lessons.	35 (7.5%)	75 (16.1%)	50 (10.8%)	221 (47.5%)	75 (16.1%)	3.80	0.75
12. There is no special teacher trained for citizenship education lessons.	45 (9.7%)	61 (13.1%)	20 (4.3%)	190 (40.9%)	140 (30.1%)		
13. There are no teaching and learning materials to teach the lessons.	50 (10.8)	80 (17.2%)	20 (4.3%)	201 (43.2%)	105 (22.6%)		
14. There is limited time allocated to teach the citizenship education lessons.	55 (11.8%)	105 (22.6%)	35 (7.5%)	191 (41.1%)	70 (15.1%)		
15. There is no workshop nor in-service training for teachers who teach citizenship education	35 (7.5%)	50 (10.8%)	30 (6.5%)	230 (49.5%)	111 (23.9%)		

Note: The data was analysed using descriptive statistics. A 5-point Likert scale was used.

Source: Field (2021)

Table 5 shows the questions used for assessing the challenges that militate against the teaching of citizenship education with five questions using a 5-point Likert scale of “Strongly disagree”, “Disagree”, “Neutral”, “Agree”, and “Strongly agree”. The responses for Strongly agree and Agree were merged to Agreed, and those for Strongly disagree and Disagree were also merged to Disagreed; however, the Neutral response was maintained. The total sum of the scores was provided for each respondent out of a possible five points (mean score 1–5). The results indicated a mean value of 3.80 (SD = 0.75) for the challenges that militate against teaching citizenship education. The teachers’ knowledge about the challenges of teaching citizenship education was divided into three levels of awareness: low, moderate and high. The cut-off point for low awareness was the 25th percentile (range 1.00–2.59); moderate awareness was determined by the 50th percentile (range 2.60–3.39); and high awareness was above the 75th percentile (range 3.40–5.00). The mean value of 3.80 (SD = 0.75) indicated that most respondents agreed with the five possible challenges that militate against the teaching of citizenship education which the researchers provided. This implies that the

teaching of citizenship education is saddled with a lack of teaching and learning materials (TLMs); limited time allocation to teach the subject, limited attention given to the subject, a lack of in-service training and workshops for the teachers, and no specially trained teachers to teach the subject.

Relationship between Gender and the Study Variables

To provide additional insight into the respondents' gender and the study variables, the researchers assessed if there was a statistically significant difference between the male and female respondents. An independent sample *t*-test was performed to compare gender with the study variables. The results showed that the male values were ($M = 3.76$, $SD = 0.71$), whereas the female values were ($M = 3.83$, $SD = 0.80$); $t = (-0.97)$; $p = 0.04$. This implies a statistically significant difference between the male and female respondents.

Research question 4: What strategies need to be adopted to improve the teaching of citizenship education?

A semi-structured interview was used to solicit the teachers' views on what strategies must be implemented to improve the teaching of citizenship education lessons. The views obtained from the teachers were thematically analysed.

Strategies for Improving the Teaching of Citizenship Education

From the semi-structured interviews, it was found that there were challenges that militate against the teaching of citizenship education lessons.

T8 commented as follows:

... there are challenges to teaching citizenship education lessons, which can be improved by allocating more time to the lesson. The lessons need to be given priority, like English and Mathematics, which are taught regularly. We also lack teaching and learning materials, making lesson delivery difficult. When teaching and learning materials are provided, the improvement of citizenship education lessons will be enhanced.

Similarly, T4 had this to say:

Most of the citizenship education syllabus topics require technical people to teach. Training special teachers or inviting resource personnel for technical topics to teach citizenship education lessons will be helpful ...

T1 was of the view that:

... the subject has been made examination-oriented. The objectives in the syllabus should be channelled to what goes on in society for pupils to benefit from the objectives of teaching citizenship education lessons ...

Furthermore, T6 said that:

... workshop and in-service training need to be conducted on some of the topics in the syllabus to educate us on how to teach them. Some of the topics are difficult to teach practically; therefore, oral teaching is mostly used ... but if a workshop is conducted on teaching such difficult topics, it will help abreast us on how to approach such concepts in the citizenship education syllabuses.

Discussion

The general purpose of the study was to identify the reasons for teaching citizenship education; identify if the teaching of citizenship education has achieved its objectives; identify the challenges that militate against the teaching of citizenship education; and identify the strategies that need to be adopted to improve the teaching of citizenship education.

Unlike previous studies, which focused on the perceptions of teachers and pupils on citizenship education lessons, the current study extended its territory by ascertaining whether the teaching of citizenship education has achieved its objectives. The citizenship education syllabus objectives were analysed because they are the road map for achieving patriotism and democracy in Ghana. For this reason, the syllabus was deemed an authoritative text for the study.

Citizenship Education Syllabus

The content of the citizenship education syllabus falls under four broad headings: individual, responsibility, authority and justice. This accompanies a mode of assessment that is expected to be practical and reflect on the intellectual attitudes, social values, and skills required for effective citizens (MOESS 2007, 5). However, the school's mode of assessment is examination-oriented, which mars the achievement of the citizenship education objectives. Ideally, the school head teacher and teachers are expected to be the major players in citizenship education through school discipline and guidance. There is also the issue of subject teachers for citizenship education. Currently, the class teachers teach the subject as part of their routine subjects, which makes it difficult for them to command mastery over the subject. If there were specially trained teachers to teach the subject, the mode of delivery would be more favourable to achieving the citizenship education objectives. Moreover, no official textbook has been prepared for the subject; different authors have written different textbooks on citizenship education, and each school decides which books are suitable for them. This does not promote the right guide for teaching the lessons, as some textbooks may serve the purpose better than others. In addition, no specially designed TLMs accompany the teaching of the concepts in the syllabus. The teachers are expected to improvise or design their own for the lesson delivery. However, some teachers cannot draw, thus such teachers are left with the option of presenting an oral lesson. According to Allaste, Beilmann and Pirk (2021), although there is an in-depth study on the role schools play in promoting

citizenship education, other external factors also have a role to play but have been an oversight for most researchers. They include the home, community leaders, church, mosque, voluntary associations, and the media. It must be emphasised that integrating formal and informal bodies will provide sufficient impetus to achieve citizenship education objectives. This is particularly true when there is a general misconception that the training of citizens lies in the custody of teachers.

The National Commission for Civic Education

The NCCE aims to enhance patriotism and democracy in Ghana and has succeeded in helping some Ghanaians to perform their civic duties through voting, protection, women empowerment, and communal labour (NCCE 2014). However, this achievement has not been sustainable as there are challenges of social vices and atrocities that have engulfed some Ghanaians. Adubofuor (2019) posited that the malnourished and malfunctioning NCCE cannot be spared due to the lack of patriotism and democracy in Ghanaian society. (Oduro-Stewart 2021) recently reported on Ankobeahene of the Yeji traditional area of the Bono East region, Nana Gyaware Kanokonko, who advised the NCCE to intensify its public education to ensure peace and unity in Ghana. This advice emerged from the numerous crimes in that district. Although the NCCE has been obliged to help promote patriotism and democracy in the country, this daunting task placed on the shoulders of the NCCE cannot be achieved without the support of other key people.

Moreover, after the formulation of the NCCE, there has not been any governing body to assess or evaluate its performance. The availability of assessment will motivate them to be proactive and strive harder to attain their mission. In addition, there has been a report by the Ghana News Agency (2020) that the NCCE has been abandoned by the government and other stakeholders, which has caused a lack of resources to fulfil their obligations and constitutional mandate. For instance, the Ghana News Agency (2014) reported the lack of accommodation for the NCCE, which hampers their work. According to them, some of their structures are in a deplorable state, which poses a threat to official documents and the staff in general. Another pertinent issue is the means of transportation. At present, the office of the NCCE can only account for four vehicles for all 33 offices across the country (NCCE 2014).

Objective 1: Reasons for Teaching Citizenship Education

Regarding the question: “What are the reasons for teaching citizenship education?”, the results indicated that many teachers understand the reasons for teaching citizenship education. Table 3 explains that generally, the largest group of teachers agreed that citizenship education helps to promote patriotism and democracy; acquire desired attitudes, character, values and skills; help to uphold and defend the image of the nation; maintain the history of the nation and appreciate efforts by her forefathers; and help to promote peace and unity in the society. These results corroborate those of Boadu’s (2016) study, which discovered that citizenship education helps prepare children to be effective and good in society as well as inculcate moral, social and cultural heritage in

children. Therefore, citizenship education lays the foundation and nurtures citizens who will demonstrate acceptable character, attitude and ideal moral values, which can contribute to the achievement of patriotism and democracy for national growth and development. It will also enhance pupils' understanding of their society to choose between good and bad. However, what is currently being experienced in Ghanaian society contradicts these objectives. Although Ghana has been adjudged as a country with a stable democratic system due to peaceful elections and has undergone decades of decentralisation, Ghana is currently witnessing pseudo-citizens who suppress the achievement of patriotism and democracy. Political challenges emanate from the country's decentralised government structure (Acheampong 2021). Currently, the political position is mostly centred at the top within the national government, suppressing the local actors' powers to address complex challenges. Ghana's democracy is tarnished with illiberal practices ranging from monetised politics, vote-buying, election-related violence, electoral fraud, and political vigilantism to judicial corruption (Nsia-Pepre 2017). The public sectors experience lateness to work, corruption, embezzlement of government funds, and weak policies favouring senior members (Okae 2021). All these vices depict the inability of the teaching of citizenship education to achieve its objectives.

Objective 2: The Achievement of the Objectives of Citizenship Education

The social vices and atrocities committed in society indicate that citizenship education has not been able to achieve its objectives. Hence, five items were used to solicit the teachers' views about achieving the citizenship education objectives. The results from Table 4 show that many teachers disagreed on all five items that citizenship education has not been able to achieve its objectives. This implies an underlying pattern to these sentiments about achieving the objectives of citizenship education. The respondents were frank in confirming this and would cherish the achievement of the objectives of citizenship education. Their responses explain why they agreed to the first objective about the aim of citizenship education. At present, several debates ensuing on public platforms are strongly driven by the lack of patriotism and democracy in the nation. This challenge may be attributed to the Ghana Education Service (GES) not employing specially trained teachers for citizenship education lessons. The NCCE posited that citizenship education aims to train youngsters to develop the skills and abilities to influence decision-making in society for the public good. It can be inferred from this statement that citizenship education can better be enhanced through teaching by specially trained teachers. Unfortunately, Ghana's education system has added citizenship education lessons to class teachers' lessons where there is a challenge regarding their mastery of teaching citizenship education lessons.

Objective 3: The Challenges that Militate against the Teaching of Citizenship Education

Certain factors have saddled the achievement of the citizenship education objectives. The results gathered from Table 5 on the five items showed that a large proportion of

the respondents agreed on the items listed by the researchers as challenges that militate against teaching citizenship education lessons. A Botswana study has indicated similar findings with Oats (2018) reporting that the teaching of citizenship education is challenged with a lack of TLMs; a lack of specially trained teachers; and limited attention given to the subject. According to the Open University (2020), TLMs significantly boost pupils' achievement by supporting their learning. TLMs also serve as a guide for the teachers and enhance their lesson delivery. Pupils can grasp a concept when physically engaging in an activity and discover things themselves. Also, using TLMs is vital for the achievement of lesson objectives. Magasu, Muleya and Mweeba's (2020) research findings also reported on the traditional teaching method, the inability to connect lessons with what happens in society, and assessment, which affects citizenship education objectives.

Ideally, citizenship education lessons should be made practical through role-playing, dramatisation, videos, and flip charts to reflect what goes on in society. Unfortunately, most teachers teach orally, leaving pupils to use their imagination. Another study by Sim and Chow (2018) similarly reported that the mode of assessment that is usually examination-oriented causes the teaching of citizenship education to lose its value. Lack of practical assessment causes pupils to lose sight of what happens in real life, hence, their inability to grasp the concept being taught for application. It is prudent when the mode of assessment is practical and reflects on societal affairs that transmit healthy democratic and patriotic ideas to the pupils.

Implications of the Study

The current research contributes theoretically to the literature available. It offers evidence that citizenship education strongly impacts democracy and patriotism; however, how it is taught in schools will help boost its chance for success. Therefore, the research supports and strengthens Rawls's theory for civic education. In addition, the research offers new insight into the fact that it is prudent for citizenship education lessons to reflect what transpires in the everyday lives of society and should be taught practically. The research has some practical implications for educational stakeholders. Firstly, as stated above, it contributes to the literature on citizenship education. Consequently, teachers and head teachers can derive from the results of the research; hence, the gap of citizenship education not being able to achieve its objectives as anticipated can be reduced by improving how the lessons are taught in schools. Secondly, the research recommends that educational stakeholders prepare teachers designated to teach the citizenship education lessons; provide all supporting TLMs; and make periodic in-service training programmes on the citizenship education lessons.

Limitations and Future Research

Finally, some potential shortfalls require consideration. First, the study's sample size was centred on teachers in the Greater Accra Region of Ghana. It is recommended that future research should use different teachers from different geographical areas, use a

comparative study; and use a larger sample size. Secondly, descriptive data analysis was used in the current study; hence, future research can resort to different data analysis methods.

Conclusion

The teaching of citizenship education requires citizens' rights and obligations. It indicates the values, norms, morality, and respect of the individual citizen's relationship with the society and the country. Thus, the current study has concluded that Ghana has played an advocacy role in enhancing patriotism and democracy through the inception of citizenship education lessons in the primary school curriculum and the establishment of the NCCE. However, the efficacy of these initiatives is yet to be seen; hence, the numerous acts of corruption, public sector mismanagement, social violence, and atrocities in the country have succeeded in eroding Ghana's moral fibre. It is evident from the study that Ghana has not been able to achieve patriotism and democracy due to the mode of teaching citizenship education lessons which is far from perfect, and also partly due to the lack of designated teachers to handle the subject; a lack of TLMs; and no in-service training nor workshops to arm teachers with the methods they need to use to teach some difficult topics.

Moreover, the work done by the NCCE is currently insufficient; hence, there is a call on them to intensify their duty of enhancing peace and unity in society. For these reasons, the role of the teacher in collaboration with other key individuals is crucial. This is particularly essential as there is a general misconception that teachers need to inculcate the spirit of patriotism and democracy in their pupils by teaching citizenship education lessons. People need to realise that the collective efforts made by some key people, such as community leaders, parents, the church, social media, and teachers, will provide enough strength to promote patriotism and democracy.

Recommendations

Considering the study results and what has been found in previous studies, the following recommendations are suggested. The reasons for teaching citizenship education need to be reframed to meet the social vices occurring in society and demotivate them from being emulated for posterity. Also, since the teaching of citizenship education has not achieved its objectives, the curriculum development councils in Ghana should make citizenship education one of the essential subjects in basic schools. They should also revise the content of the citizenship education syllabus to be action- or practical-oriented and contain topics that help promote patriotism and democracy. Citizenship education lessons should refrain from examination-oriented assessment and should rather be based on the practical assessment of pupils' positive attitudes, values, and self-reflection abilities.

Furthermore, by examining the crucial roles Ghana's constitution assigns to the NCCE, there is an urgent call on the government, non-governmental organisations (NGOs),

development partners, and volunteers to cushion the NCCE with resources such as logistics and mobile vans to enable it to perform its constitutional mandate and obligations by intensifying its public education to all and sundry at their doorstep across the 16 regions in Ghana. In addition, the challenges discovered to militate against the proper teaching of the lessons should be considered and addressed by the educational stakeholders. Moreover, the strategies needed to improve citizenship education can be achieved if the government can provide TLMs for teachers to use conventionally. Using role-play, discussion, videos, flip charts, dramatisation, and inviting technical people in the field of specialisation to handle technical topics is also recommended. At the teacher training college level, special teachers should be trained to teach citizenship education to enable them to command mastery over the lessons. A well-grounded teacher with academic expertise accompanied by discipline can inculcate satisfactory knowledge in pupils. Also, one designated textbook for citizenship education lessons should enhance centralised teaching of the same concept to achieve the citizenship education objectives. The government could also build a citizenship education resource centre to train teachers to be resourceful in their lesson delivery.

The mass media can promote democracy and patriotism on television, and radio stations can constantly remind individuals to be mindful of the noble character and attitude required in everyday life and at the workplace. The public sector should be improved by digitalizing some modes of work. For example, the mode for collecting money could be scanning a code that would go directly into the government's account rather than individuals collecting it, which could breed bribery and corruption. Also, closed-circuit television could be installed in the various public sectors to regulate the activities that transpire at the workplace. There should be strong and effective working policies, with those who contradict them being sanctioned to deter others.

Community leaders need to formulate rules and regulations that require strong enforcement, with culprits being sanctioned to deter others. According to Batidam (2015), the National Anti-Corruption Action Plan (2015–2024) recommends the capacity building of the general public, thereby ensuring transparency and accountability, institutional efficacy, and an effective investigation that accompanies the prosecution of corrupt conduct, which are all collective measures in fighting against corruption. Parents should inculcate in their children the spirit of patriotism and democracy in the home by serving as role models and drawing the children's attention to some good practices in society that enhance nation-building and bad practices that mar the nation's growth. The various denominations (Christians and Muslims) can contribute to this aim by preaching it in sermons. The police should be active in ensuring citizens are law-abiding and prosecuting culprits. This can be done by eliminating nepotism, bribery and favouritism.

It is also recommended that Ghanaians emulate the good works done by their forefathers, their ideologies, principles, strengths, selfless service to humanity, and courage. They should also learn from their mistakes, failures and weaknesses.

Ghanaians need to adopt the spirit of nationalism, patriotism and democracy by inscribing it into their hearts and minds. This can be achieved by putting the nation of Ghana first and collectively aiming to uphold and defend the country's good name and integrity.

References

- Ababio, J. 2021. "Sing These 5 Patriotic Songs with All Your Heart." Kuulpeeps. Accessed July 5, 2023. <https://kuulpeeps.com/2021/03/03/Sing-These-5-Patriotic-Songs-with-All-Your-Heart/Pop-Culture>
- Acheampong, R. A. 2021. "Accra's Major Challenge Is That Politics Gets in the Way of Progress." The Conversation. Accessed July 5, 2023. <https://theconversation.com/accra-major-challenge-is-that-politics-gets-in-the-way-of-progress-170473>
- Adams, F. H., S. Andoh, and A. M. Quarshie. 2013. "Effective Teaching of Citizenship Education in Primary Schools in Ghana." *Journal of Education and Practice* 4 (10): 18–23. <https://www.iiste.org/Journals/index.php/JEP/article/view/5787/5930>
- Adetula, V. 2016. "Growing Mistrust – a Threat to Democracy in Ghana. Opportunities and Challenges in the Upcoming Elections." NAI Policy Note. Uppsala: Nordic Africa Institute.
- Adubofuor, G. 2019. "Patriotism: Lost Commodity in the Marrows of Ghanaians." Modern Ghana. Accessed July 5, 2023. <https://www.modernghana.com/News/945845/Patriotism-Lost-Commodity-in-the-Marrows-of-Ghana.html>
- Allaste, A-A., M. Beilmann, and R. Pirk. 2021. "Non-Formal and Informal Learning as Citizenship Education: The Views of Young People and Youth Policymakers." *Journal of Applied Youth Studies* 5: 19–35. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s43151-021-00059-z>
- Anoff-Ntow, K. A. 2016. "Public Broadcasting and the Politics of Media in Ghana: A Case Study of the Ghana Broadcasting Corporation (GBC)." PhD diss., University of Calgary. <http://hdl.handle.net/11023/2860>
- Batidam, D. 2015. "Fighting Corruption: Moving from Rhetoric to Action." Accessed July 5, 2023. <https://citifmonline.com/2015/04/Fighting-Corruption-Moving-from-Rhetoric-to-Action/>
- Boadu, K. 2016. "Citizenship Education in Colleges of Education in Ghana: A Preliminary Study into Social Studies Tutors' and Trainees' Understanding." *International Journal of Learning, Teaching and Educational Research* 15 (3): 143–160.
- Congressional Research Service. 2023. "Ghana: Overview and U.S. Policy." Accessed July 5, 2023. <https://sgp.fas.org/crs/row/R47329.pdf>

- Dworkin, S. L. 2012. "Sample Size Policy for Qualitative Studies Using In-Depth Interviews." *Archives of Sexual Behavior* 41: 1319–1320. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10508-012-0016-6>
- Fidaoui, D. 2022. "Civic Education and Citizenship Education: A Qualitative Study of Secondary Social Studies Teachers' Understandings of the Concepts and Practices of Citizenship Education for Immigrant Students." PhD diss., Syracuse University. <https://surface.syr.edu/etd/1391>
- Freedom House. 2021. "Freedom in the World 2021." Accessed July 5, 2023. <https://freedomhouse.org/country/ghana/freedom-world/2021>
- Ghana News Agency. 2014. "Lack of Accommodation Hampers NCCE Work." Accessed July 5, 2023. <https://www.graphic.com.gh/news/politics/lack-of-accommodation-hampers-ncce-work.html>
- Ghana News Agency. 2020. "NCCE's Low Resources; Major Threat to the Fight against COVID-19." Accessed July 5, 2023. <https://gna.org.gh/2020/05/ncces-low-resources-major-threat-to-the-fight-against-covid-19/>
- GreenViews. 2021. "Ghana's National Anthem – History and Controversy." Accessed July 5, 2023. <https://greenviewsresidential.com/Ghanas-National-Anthem-History-and-Controversy/>
- Kezban, K. 2014. "Teacher Perspectives on Civic and Human Rights Education." *Educational Research and Reviews* 9 (10): 302–311. <https://doi.org/10.5897/ERR2013.1707>
- Kyei, S., and J. T. Liyab. 2022. "Exploring the Role of Social Studies as a School Subject in Achieving National Cohesion in Ghana." *International Journal of Research in Humanities and Social Studies* 9 (2): 31–34. <https://doi.org/10.22259/2694-6296.0902>
- Magasu, O., G. Muleya, and L. Mweeba. 2018. "Pedagogical Challenges in Teaching Civic Education in Secondary Schools in Zambia." *International Journal of Science and Research* 9 (3): 1483–1488. <https://doi.org/10.21275/SR20327121153>
- Manu-Osafo, M. J., L. Enoch, and K. T. Asante. 2021. "'What Are We Celebrating?': Nation-Building and the Politics of Independence Commemoration in Ghana." *Open Edition Journals* 1–21. <https://doi.org/10.4000/erea.12889>
- MOESS (Ministry of Education, Science and Sports). 2007. "Teaching Syllabus for Citizenship Education (Basic 4–6)." Accra: MOESS.
- Morrison, H. B. 1984. "Some Implications in Rawls' Theory for Civic Education." *Journal of Negro Education* 53 (1): 78–84.
- NCCE (National Commission for Civic Education). 2014. "Medium-Term Development Plan Under Draft National Medium-Term Development Planning Framework 2015–2017."

- Nsia-Pepira, K. 2017. "Flawed Democracy: The Bane of Ghana's Success in Curbing Corruption." *ASPJ Africa & Francophonie* 62–78.
https://www.airuniversity.af.edu/Portals/10/ASPJ_French/journals_E/Volume-08_Issue-2/nsia-pepira_e.pdf
- Oats, R. 2018. "Challenges of Teaching Citizenship Education Topics at Senior Secondary School Level in Botswana." *Journal of Educational Studies*. <https://www.rroij.com/open-access/challenges-of-teaching-citizenship-education-topics-at-senior-secondary-schoollevel-in-botswana.php?aid=87239>
- Oduro-Stewart, D. 2021a. "NCCE Urged to Intensify Education toward National Peace and Unity." *Modern Ghana*. Accessed July 5, 2023.
<https://www.modernghana.com/News/1117240/Ncce-Urged-to-Intensify-Education-toward-National.html>
- Oduro-Stewart, D. 2021b. "Sene West NCCE Celebrates Citizenship Week." *Modern Ghana*. Accessed July 5, 2023. <https://www.modernghana.com/News/1086332/Sene-West-Ncce-Celebrates-Citizenship-Week.html>
- Okae, S. T. 2021. "Public Sector Verses Private Sector." *Modern Ghana*. Accessed July 5, 2023. <https://www.modernghana.com/News/1093438/Public-Sector-Verses-Private-Sector.html>
- Open University. 2020. "Purpose of Teaching and Learning Materials." Accessed July 5, 2023. <https://www.open.edu/openlearncreate/mod/page/view.php?id=168509>
- RexDanquah, M. N. 2021. "Arise Ghana Youth for Your Country." *GhanaWeb*. Accessed July 5, 2023. <https://www.graphic.com.gh/features/features/arise-ghana-youth-for-your-country.html>
- Sim, J. B. Y., and L. T. Chow. 2020. "The Development of Civic Participation among Youth in Singapore." In *The Palgrave Handbook of Citizenship and Education*, edited by A. Peterson, G. Stahl and H. Soong, 759–777. Cham: Palgrave Macmillan.
https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-319-67828-3_8
- Smail, A. 2023. "Oneness, Indigeneity, and Ghanaian Citizenship(s): Lessons Learned from Teachers." PhD diss., University of Glasgow. <http://theses.gla.ac.uk/83622/>
- Tawil, S. 2013. "Education for 'Global Citizenship': A Framework for Discussion." *Education Research and Foresight*, United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization Working Papers. Accessed July 5, 2023.
<https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000223784>
- UN (United Nations). 2012. "Global Education First Initiative." Accessed July 5, 2023.
<https://www.un.org/millenniumgoals/pdf/The%20Global%20Education%20First%20Initiative.pdf>

UNODC (United Nations Office on Drugs and Crime). 2022. "Corruption in Ghana: People's Experiences and Views." Accessed July 5, 2023.
https://www.unodc.org/documents/corruption/Publications/2022/GHANA_-_Corruption_survey_report_-_20.07.2022.pdf

Zengulaaru, J., and E. Nyamekye. 2022. "Investigating Students' Preferred Instructional Methods for Teaching Social Studies in a Selected Senior High School in Afadzato South District, Ghana." *Social Education Research* 4 (1): 15–32.
<https://doi.org/10.37256/ser.4120231491>