

Exploring Strategies for Rebranding of Technical and Vocational Education in Developing Countries: A Case of Ghanaian Tutors and Administrators

Ernest Kissi

<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-1975-3382>
Kwame Nkrumah University of Science
and Technology, Ghana
kisernest@gmail.com

Michael Adesi

<https://orcid.org/0000-0003-3222-9531>
Kwame Nkrumah University of Science
and Technology, Ghana
adesimichael@yahoo.com

Alex Acheampong

<https://orcid.org/0000-0003-1387-8616>
Kwame Nkrumah University of Science
and Technology, Ghana
achielex@yahoo.com

Ivy Maame Abu

<https://orcid.org/0000-0002-6299-1909>
Kwame Nkrumah University of Science
and Technology, Ghana
ivy.abu@gmail.com

Abstract

Despite the persistent request from educational stakeholders to embrace technical and vocational education training (TVET) for sustainable livelihood and development, enrolment in TVET institutions in developing countries is still very low. This study, therefore, seeks to explore factors for the rebranding of TVET in Ghana. This quantitative study proposed five key strategies to be adopted in rebranding TVET in Ghana: government; training providers; parents and guardians; donor and development partners; and employer-related rebranding strategies. The study reveals that governmental strategies perceived to be critical in the rebranding of TVET in Ghana include offering legislative backing to national TVET policy, mainstreaming vocational education into the general education system, and setting up venture capital to support TVET graduates. Trainers should develop business plans to support training activities, networking, and benchmarking with other providers, and establish strong linkages and collaboration with employers and industry. The findings of this study are critical to the development of Ghana and other developing countries as TVET significantly contributes to developing the skill base of any country and increases the employment rate. Rebranding TVET is a step in the right direction towards implementing government policies.

UNISA 

International Journal of Educational Development in Africa
#12224 | 22 pages

<https://doi.org/10.25159/2312-3540/12224>

ISSN 2312-3540 (Online)

© The Author(s) 2024



Published by Unisa Press. This is an Open Access article distributed under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution-ShareAlike 4.0 International License (<https://creativecommons.org/licenses/by-sa/4.0/>)

Keywords: rebranding; stakeholder; strategy; technical and vocational education; TVET

Introduction

The acquisition of skills and knowledge is generally perceived as the driving force of national development (Ayonmike et al. 2013). It is emphasised that knowledge alone is not adequate for economic growth and social development but needs to be complemented by skills (Bewaji 2013). Several nations, including Ghana, have therefore identified technical and vocational education (TVE) as a critical means of providing quality education in the form of technology and related science and practical skills and knowledge to the youth to eradicate poverty and nurture self-reliance and sustainable livelihood (Ogbuanya and Oluwasola 2015). TVE has been described as the training of individuals to implement the technological development of a nation by providing the citizens with the right skills necessary for employment (Alam 2008). TVE is also seen as a means of preparing for occupational fields and effective participation in the world of work (Ayonmike 2016). It is perceived as an educational programme for producing skilled manpower for the various sectors of a nation's economy, creating jobs for citizens, and improving the economy through wealth generation (Ayonmike 2016).

TVE in Ghana is rooted in missionary activities from the 1830s (Amedorme and Fiagbe 2013), where children were trained in crafts like blacksmithing, masonry, and carpentry during the colonial era. The Governor of the Gold Coast from 1914 to 1927, Sir Gordon Guggisberg, proposed sixteen principles of education that demanded trade schools provide literacy and technical education to equip young men with the needed skilled artisanship and citizenship behaviour (McWilliam and Kwamena-Poh 1975). With the desire to improve the people's socio-economic life, four government trade schools (technical and vocational schools) were established in the Eastern, Ashanti, Central, and Greater-Accra regions in 1922 and later in Yendi in the Northern Region in 1925 (Kemevor and Kassah 2015). In an attempt to meet the labour demand of industry, the government increased the number of schools from five in 1953 to eight in 1956 to train sufficiently skilled labour. The school was renamed 'Technical Institutes' in these developments and later awarded the City & Guilds certificate (UNESCO 1984).

Subsequent governments of Ghana after independence have reformed and restructured the educational system with much emphasis on technical and vocational education and training (TVET) to enhance the relevance of the educational system to industry and the general world of work to minimise unemployment and poverty by boosting the informal economy (Agbenyo 2010). The government of Ghana recognises the role of TVET in rapid economic growth and hence emphasises TVET in the Ghana Poverty Reduction Strategy (GPRS). The basic orientation and philosophy of the Ghana Vision 2020 are to realign TVET with national goals and aspirations and local and global demands (Ansah and Kissi 2013). Some of these goals are to increase the relevance of schooling by imparting individuals with the skills and knowledge necessary for making the individual a productive member of society, to reduce unemployment as a result of the

provision of employable skills especially to the youth and those who cannot succeed academically, to increase economic development because it improves the quality and skill level of the working population, to reduce poverty by giving the individuals who participate access to higher-income occupations, and to transform the attitude of people to favour occupations where there are occupational prospects for future (Essel et al. 2014).

The level of entrepreneurship among the Ghanaian youth is very low. The educational system, including TVET, primarily trains the youth for white-collar jobs with a limited focus on skilled labour and entrepreneurship. Entrepreneurship is a goal of the TVET programme. The study of Palmer (2014) indicates that education supplies young people with skills for life, which are important components of inclusive and equitable growth as they are needed to build capacity and professionalism in business. In Nwosu and Micah's (2017) study, the authors indicate that the Nigerian National Policy on Education outlined the goals of TVET with one of the goals being to provide trained manpower in business. TVET is generally marginalised, as it is perceived to lead to blue-collar jobs that are less prestigious and of low status (Dzeto 2014). Many parents, as well as TVET teachers in Ghana, are therefore less willing to allow their wards to study TVET programmes due to the stigmatisation of the programme, its limited academic opportunities and academic progression, and the characterised low level of prestige (Amedorme and Fiagbe 2013).

Ghana's share of entry into TVET is as low as 13.2 per cent compared to the 53.2 per cent of Germany, 55.1 per cent of Finland, 20.9 per cent of Burkina Faso, and 22.4 per cent of Cameroon, according to a report by the African Centre for Economic Transformation (Dzeto 2014; Maiga 2013). Besides the low entry level, the quality of the TVET programmes in Ghana is questionable. They have woefully failed to produce well-equipped graduates either to meet the human resource needs of the industry or equip them to be self-employable (Aryeetey et al. 2011; Ogbuanya and Oluwasola 2015). Amedorme and Fiagbe (2013) indicate low patronage of TVE in Ghana due to problems such as a lack of facilities and materials for training students, inadequate technical teachers or facilitators, a limited number of training institutions for technical teachers, and difficulty in career progression. Similarly, Oketch (2001) indicates that there is low prestige of TVE due to widespread concern about poor-quality training and training environments and negative public attitudes and perceptions regarding TVET. The base of the problem is that Ghana cannot steer a larger share of secondary and higher education students into TVE relative to countries in the developed world and even its neighbours in Africa (Maiga 2013). Therefore, it is evident that the TVET programme in Ghana requires rebranding and restructuring to achieve the desired national development.

Besides, TVET enrolment in secondary level education in sub-Saharan Africa was about 8 per cent in 2010 relative to 12 per cent for countries in Asia (African Transformation Report 2014). Despite some progress, TVET institutions in Africa are still too

theoretical and are not providing the real skills needed for the world of work. The participation of the youth in the labour force in Ghana is low (22%) and persistently decreasing (Baah-Boateng and Baffour-Awuah 2015). In Ghana, youth unemployment has risen steadily from 9.53 per cent in 2008 to 13.7 per cent in 2018, reaching a peak of 14.1 per cent in 2015, even during the phase of several reformations of the TVET programme (Plecher 2019). Many perceive the neglect of TVET to be the missing link in Ghana's industrial development (Ansah and Kissi 2013). Notwithstanding the recognition of TVET as a critical educational subsector in the industrial development of Ghana, teaching and learning have persistently declined in quality with the associated outdated training content (Ansah and Kissi 2013). TVET institutions have obsolete and inadequate facilities and equipment, matched by equally obsolete academic curricula that do not keep up with current labour needs. Ghana's Vision 2020 policy encapsulated in the GPRS with industrial development goals are perceived as unachievable without TVET at all levels. The vision to produce quality TVET for economic growth, leadership, and sustainable development has been counterproductive, though there are institutions which are mandated to ensure the actualisation of the vision, that is, the Council for Technical and Vocational Education and Training (COTVET).

Head-on learning by teachers is generally the form of teaching in Ghana. Combining practical exposure with theoretical training to produce highly skilled and qualified manpower for industry is proving difficult for many TVET training centres. Ghanaians, therefore, have a low level of confidence and faith in TVET as a concrete government policy for national development and poverty reduction. Consequently, it is evident that the TVET framework requires rebranding to attain the desired national development goals. Besides, many studies on TVET in Ghana have largely focused on the prospects and challenges of TVET in reaching targets (Amedorme and Fiagbe 2013; Kemevor and Kassah 2015; Odoom et al. 2016; Ogbonda and Wobi 2016) and strategies (Kissi et al. 2020) with limited emphasis on the possibility of stakeholders' efforts in an attempt to rebrand the programme to make it a more attractive and first career choice among the many youths in Ghana. This paper, therefore, seeks to explore the factors for rebranding the TVET programme to optimise the interest of the youth in TVE in developing countries using Ghana as a case study.

The Need for Rebranding TVET Education

TVET in Ghana is confronted by several challenges related to teaching methods and materials, funding, national guiding framework, inadequate technical teachers or facilitators, and institutional-related factors. For instance, the qualitative research of Kemevor and Kassah (2015) that involved the survey of stakeholders such as parents, teachers, employers, government and private institutional heads, alumni, and students of second-cycle institutions reported large class sizes in the few existing technical and vocational institutions that are not matched with the supply and provision of training resources as well as the deplorable state of infrastructure and training facilities of the institutions and outdated training content as some of the critical challenges of TVET in Ghana. The TVET institutions were reported to lack adequate workshops, tools,

equipment, and materials for their practical work. Another critical challenge facing TVET in Ghana currently is the low prestige perception of the public. Aside from inadequate financing and negative views, the socio-economic environment and the contextual framework within which TVE is delivered in Ghana are characterised in general by other factors such as huge numbers of poorly educated, unskilled and unemployed youth; uncoordinated, unregulated and fragmented delivery systems; low-quality gender and economic inequities; weak monitoring and evaluation mechanisms; and poor management and ill-adapted organisational structures (African Union 2007). These challenges are perceived to reduce the instructor's capacity to attract and sustain the attention of all students during demonstration lessons. Amedorme and Fiagbe (2013) indicate that the challenges of TVET in Ghana range from the limited number of technical institutes available in the country to the lack of facilities and materials for training students, inadequate technical teachers or facilitators, a limited number of training institutions for technical teachers, and difficulty in career progression to the negative public attitudes and perceptions towards TVET in Ghana. Atchoarena and Delluc (2001) report several challenges of TVET in sub-Saharan Africa, including a mismatch between acquired skills and market needs, widespread concern about poor-quality training and training environments, and negative public attitudes and perceptions regarding TVET. Appiah-Kwapong et al. (2017) also report a lack of entrepreneurial skills and start-up capital as the two major challenges facing students in TVET institutions in Ghana.

In terms of curriculum and national framework lapses, the study of Idris and Mbudai (2017) on the challenges of TVET in Kano State in Nigeria reports that the curriculum of TVET is adequate in terms of content and covers the skill element needed. Still, it is lacking in terms of implementation of achieving the desired national goals. The study further indicates that the curriculum favours technical colleges as a training institution for graduates to further their education but not for employment as designed by the policy because of the fewer practical periods allocated for the trade subjects. The World Bank (2017) reports that Ghana spends a higher proportion of its total budget and gross domestic product (GDP) on education than the other thirteen Economic Community of West African States (ECOWAS), ranging from 6 per cent to 8 per cent between 2011 and 2015 (Ministry of Education 2018). The TVET sector is immensely affected by the inadequacy of funding in developing countries. Compared to high school (junior and senior levels) education in Ghana and internationally, TVET programmes are costly due to the higher need for equipment and materials (Palmer 2009). The TVET programme in Ghana has only been allocated roughly 1.5 per cent of the Ministry of Education's budget in the past few years. As a result of its insufficient funding allocation, fewer than 30 per cent of the TVET institutes are adequately equipped, while others suffer from various degrees of insufficiency in infrastructure, equipment, staffing, and funding (Baffour-Awuah and Thompson 2011). There is also a mismatch between the supplied labour and demanded labour; thus, TVET programmes in Ghana tend to be more theoretical (Ning and Shunde 2013). TVET graduates cannot work with modern technology.

Factors for the Rebranding of TVET

The concept of rebranding in management phraseology implies linking a name or trademark with a product or service (Abdullahi et al. 2012). A brand of product can only be rebranded if it is already in existence. Thus, the rebranding of the TVET programme involves repackaging it to make it more attractive to all people and redesigning the curriculum to ensure the achievement of targets. TVET has failed to meet the target of productivity and national development due to the varying challenges of the TVET programme in the developing world, as discussed. It must be noted that TVE has failed in terms of its stated goals and vision. For every educational system, there are targets that need to be met which must translate into productivity measures of the set group. Here, society remains the ultimate beneficiary of such results. Poor implementation of TVET in many developing countries has been emphasised as a major challenge derailing the programme's impact on national growth and development (Lawal 2013). Lawal (2013), therefore, stresses the need for the rebranding of the TVET programme from the basic to the tertiary level of education. Abdullahi et al. (2012) in Nigeria also argue that the rebranding of the TVET programme should be done through the re-orientation of the citizenry. Based on the challenges of the TVET programme in many developing countries, some of the common factors perceived to be essential in the rebranding of the TVET programme are: restructuring and adequate funding of the informal apprenticeships, providing opportunities for TVET students to further their education to the highest level, designing the training of TVET to match the demand of the labour market, creating awareness of the role of TVET in individual and national development, emphasising theory less and focusing more on practical sections, bridging the wage differential gap between the graduates of the normal school system and TVET graduates, including that programmes or courses in the TVET programme should match the labour market and matching the level of investment in TVET to the normal educational sector.

Formal school-based, less prevalent forms of skills training than informal apprenticeships occur outside the formal education system (Almeida et al. 2015). The main reason for this is that in most developing countries, a large proportion of young people do not complete lower secondary school, which is the minimum level for accessing most formal TVET programmes (Global Partnership for Education (GPE) and UNESCO 2015; Maclean and Pavlova 2013). By contrast, informal TVET, provided by micro or small enterprises in the informal economy sector, requires no formal qualifications and avoids the direct and indirect costs of accessible and cost-effective training routes for young people from poor households. King and Palmer (2010) indicate that access to quality formal schooling also impacts on the access to and speed of acquiring skills in informal apprenticeships. Evidence points, further, to a host of benefits that literacy and numeracy have for graduates of formal and informal skills training making use of their acquired skills in self-employment.

More so, the practical skills and work experience of graduates from the non-formal sector and graduates of dual-training programmes tend to have better job matches and

attract higher wages at the beginning of their working lives than graduates of pure school-based TVET programmes (Ryan 2001). However, dual-training graduates' relative wage advantage tends to decline or vanish over the longer term, resulting in lifetime earnings that are not discernibly different to those of pure school-based TVET graduates. Dual-training programmes produce declining returns compared to school-based TVET because they emphasise occupation-specific versus general skills (Hanushek et al. 2017). Thus, some studies highlight the importance of strengthening the foundations of basic knowledge taught in TVET to increase graduates' employability and wages over a longer life cycle (OECD 2017). Also, redesigning and restructuring the TVET programme is required to consider the wage differential gap to make all forms of TVET attractive to the youth. The level of focus and investment in TVET is suggested to be increased and prioritised. Targeted investment to improve the quality of TVET, especially when combined with policies to promote TVET's benefits to employers, can have a significant positive impact on graduates' productivity and wage levels (European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training 2013). In the Republic of Korea, where the state has invested heavily in TVET to produce skilled workers for its manufacturing and construction industries, secondary TVET graduates now earn about 30 per cent more than their general education counterparts (Kim 2013). In the context of Ghana, Mohammed (2020) states that TVET education can improve job matching and can also increase long-term job stability, especially if the learned skills are occupation-specific. These long-term employment relations will increase lifetime earnings. Students of all TVET programmes should be provided with equal opportunities to pursue higher education to have a more progressive career path. In many developing countries, secondary TVET graduates do not have access to further or higher education and are thus forced to exit the education system earlier than secondary general education graduates, resulting in lower relative wages (Adams 2007). Where developing countries have taken steps to improve TVET graduates' access to further and higher education, perceptions of TVET as a "dead end" have changed and relative returns to TVET have increased (Adams 2007).

There is also the need to enhance the relevance of the training programme of TVET to the labour market. TVE aims to equip young people with the technical and professional skills needed for the socio-economic development of the country. The emphasis is on training people for self-employment. The government also recognises the strengthening of TVET to develop the technical and skilled human resource base, which Ghana needs urgently as a key strategy for rapid economic growth (Ansah and Kissi 2013). Currently, the TVET system in Ghana provides education and training in manufacturing, construction technology, commerce, and science, among other areas. Although TVET is recognised as an important subsector for obtaining industrial development in Ghana, the training content at some levels is outdated. The quality of teaching and learning has continued to decline. Returns to TVET are higher if training closely matches available employment opportunities. For example, in Israel in 1983, secondary TVET graduates earned 8–10 per cent more than academic high school graduates if they entered an occupation matching their qualifications; however, if TVET graduates worked in

occupations unrelated to their training, there was no wage differential between the groups (Neuman and Ziderman 1999).

In many developing countries, formal TVET is publicly provided with little private sector involvement, resulting in training being delinked from labour market needs and outdated curricula (Glick et al. 2015). A systematic review by Onderi et al. (2014) on restructuring TVET for sustainable development in sub-Saharan Africa emphasises the need for long-life restructuring of TVET in sub-Saharan Africa to stimulate higher outcomes in the form of national and sustainable development. The review stresses several strategies in the restructuring including the mobilisation of all stakeholders to share responsibilities for all; the mobilisation of various stakeholders for strong cooperation; technical and financial support towards the reconstruction process and reforms in TVET; adequate training equipment and tools, adequate training materials such as textbooks and training manuals, and qualified instructors with experience in enterprises to enhance quality delivery in TVET; ensuring trainees of their employability after their training by adopting training that provides acquisition of employable skills which are related to the demands of the current labour market; and establish monitoring agencies with representation from all stakeholders for vocational training under the ministries of education or as autonomous bodies which should coordinate the training activities of TVET. Moreover, in a recent study, Kissi et al. (2020) identify four key strategies needed to improve entrepreneurial skills and entrepreneurial education among TVE students in Ghana: learner/student-centred education; problem-based learning; classrooms that encourage development of intellectual aptitudes; and activity-based learning. Kissi et al. (2020) stress that the identified strategies are cogent for policymakers and educationists to adopt in enhancing and developing the acumen of technical and vocational students.

Research Methodology

The research adopted a quantitative method, where data was collected in two phases. The first phase was both a literature review and a pilot survey. The literature review aided in the identification of strategies for rebranding TVE and grouping it to form a manageable construct. Following this, a pilot survey was conducted using an open-ended questionnaire involving ten educationists and practitioners. They were selected based on their knowledge and experience of the subject matter to validate the rebranding factors identified from the literature. The second phase dealt with the development of the questionnaire based on the pilot survey. Questionnaire development at this phase was purely close-ended, with two main sections. The categorical formats employed included multiple-choice questions and the Likert scale in the form of five pointers (ranging from strongly disagree: 1 to strongly agree: 5). The first part of the questionnaire used measurement items to look at the socio-demographic characteristics of the respondents. The second part of the questionnaire employed thirty-three items or statements to examine the factors related to rebranding the TVET programme in Ghana. The rebranding strategies looked at several stakeholders and their potential

contributions to the rebranding process. The items employed in the section were largely used from previous studies (e.g., Abdullahi et al. 2012; Almeida et al. 2015; Hanushek et al. 2017; Lawal 2013; Maclean and Pavlova 2013; Onderi et al. 2014).

Sample Size

A research population is generally a large collection of individuals or objects that focus on a scientific query (Banerjee and Chaudhury 2010). In this study, the target population constituted all TVET tutors and administrators in second-cycle TVET institutions in Ghana (N = 160). In determining the sample size for the study, a tutor and an administrator were considered for each institution, thus resulting in a sample size of 320. Out of the 320 questionnaires administered purposively, 200 were retrieved, representing a response rate of 63 per cent. This rate was achieved due to constant follow-up and face-to-face administration of the questionnaire consistent with previous studies (Kissi et al. 2020). The majority of the respondents (70%) were BSc holders, and 30 per cent had a Higher National Diploma. In terms of experience, it is worth noting that 20 per cent had one to three years' working experience, 30 per cent had four to six years' working experience, 15 per cent had seven to nine years' working experience, and 35 per cent had over ten years' working experience. This background information gives strong credibility to each respondent's knowledge and adequate experience in TVET education in Ghana to provide the required data for the study.

Data Analysis

Following this, the questionnaires received were coded and analysed using IBM SPSS version 21. Mean score analysis was conducted to determine the importance of each strategy relative to each other (table 1). Here, the emphasis of the analysis was on the importance of each strategy from the perspectives of both tutors and administrators. In previous studies (Chan et al. 2003; Mao et al. 2015), the mean score method of analysis was used to rank the relative importance of specific factors as perceived in descending order of significance, which is similar to this study. It is also worth noting that the mean score ranking provided a structured approach to evaluate and prioritise the strategies based on the average performance across different factors. The factors for rebranding TVET in Ghana are discussed in this section of the study, including the possible factors related to the various stakeholders of the TVET programme in the quest of rebranding the TVET programme in Ghana. The considered stakeholders were the government, parents and guardians, training providers, donor and development partners, and employers.

Table 1: Strategies for rebranding TVET in Ghana

No.	Strategies					
	Rebranding strategies related to government	Mean	SD	Rank	Average mean	Overall ranking
1	Give legislative backing to national TVET policies	4.90	0.30	1st		
	Mainstream vocational education into the general education system so that the vocational track is less dead end	4.85	0.35	2nd		
	Invest in TVET instructor training and enhance status of instructors	4.81	0.41	3rd		
	Set up venture capital to support TVET graduates	4.79	0.44	4th		
	Build leadership and management capacity to drive TVET system	4.78	0.46	5th		
	Introduce information and communications technology into TVET	4.76	0.48	6th	4.75	1st
	Introduce policies and incentives to support increased private sector participation in TVET delivery	4.75	0.43	7th		
	Introduce sustainable financing schemes for TVET	4.75	0.53	8th		
	Improve coherence of governance and management of TVET	4.70	0.57	9th		
	Partner informal TVET trainers to incorporate literacy and numeracy skills into their training programmes	4.69	0.47	10th		

	Invest in training materials and equipment	4.68	0.45	11th		
	Institute measures to reduce gender, economic, and geographical inequities in TVET provision	4.67	0.55	12th		
	Increase funding support to the sector	4.66	0.56	13th		
	Constantly monitor and periodically evaluate the performance of the system and apply corrective measures accordingly	4.65	0.57	14th		
	Rebranding strategies related to training providers					
	Develop business plans to support training activities	4.78	0.47	1st		
	Network and benchmark with other providers	4.70	0.48	2nd		
	Establish strong linkages and collaboration with employers and industry	4.69	0.49	3rd		
2	Mainstream gender into training activities and programmes	4.65	0.49	4th	4.66	2nd
	Institute bursary schemes for poor trainees	4.64	0.54	5th		
	Strengthen guidance and counselling services to trainees	4.62	0.55	6th		
	Provide training within national policy framework	4.55	0.74	7th		
	Rebranding strategies related to parents and guardians					
3	Lobby politicians in favour of TVET	4.70	0.45	1st	3.83	5th

	Support activities of training providers	4.65	0.47	2nd		
	Support children and wards to choose the vocational education stream	3.55	0.97	3rd		
	Reject perception that TVET is for the less academically endowed	2.40	1.07	4th		
Rebranding strategies related to donors and development partners						
	Fund TVET research and advocacy	4.72	0.45	1st		
	Support capacity building in TVET sector	4.70	0.45	2nd		
4	Help identify and disseminate best practices in TVET	4.65	0.47	3rd	4.65	3rd
	Support TVET advocacy initiatives	4.63	0.49	4th		
	Support development of national TVET policies and strategies	4.55	0.59	5th		
Rebranding strategies related to employers						
	Provide opportunities for industrial attachment for trainees	4.70	0.45	1st		
5	Contribute financially to a national training fund	4.65	0.47	2nd	4.61	4th
	Provide opportunities for TVET teachers to update their workplace experience regularly	4.60	0.49	3rd		
	Deliver workplace training to employees	4.55	0.59	4th		

Contribute to the development of national skills standards	4.53	0.60	5th
--	------	------	-----

Rebranding Strategies Related to Government

The inventory of governmental strategies perceived essential to the rebranding of the TVET programme in Ghana is discussed and identified through the mean score (\bar{x}) and standard deviation (SD). Table 1 shows that the respondents perceived the offering of legislative backing to national TVET policies as a critical governmental strategy in the rebranding of TVET in Ghana ($\bar{x} = 4.90$, $SD = .30$). These findings are consistent with previous studies that also emphasise legislative backing to national TVET policy, mainstream vocational education into the general education system, and investment in TVET instructor training as governmental strategies in the rebranding of the TVET programme (e.g., Abdullahi et al. 2012; Adams 2007; Almeida et al. 2015; Lawal 2013). The respondents agreed on the need to improve the coherence of governance and management of TVET as a critical governmental strategy in the rebranding of TVET in Ghana ($\bar{x} = 4.70$, $SD = .57$). These findings are consistent with previous studies that also emphasise the introduction of policies and incentives to support increased private sector participation in TVET delivery, introduction of sustainable financing schemes for TVET, and the need for the improvement of coherence of governance and management of TVET as governmental strategies in the rebranding of the TVET programme (cf. Abdullahi et al. 2012; Adams 2007; Almeida et al. 2015; Lawal 2013).

Rebranding Strategies Related to Training Providers

It is evident from the study results, as depicted in table 1, that the respondents acknowledged the development of business plans to support training activities as a critical training provider-related strategy in the rebranding of TVET in Ghana ($\bar{x} = 4.78$, $SD = .47$). In addition, networking and benchmarking with other providers as a training provider-related strategy is necessary in the rebranding of TVET in Ghana ($\bar{x} = 4.70$, $SD = .48$) is deemed the second most crucial training provider-related strategy in the quest to rebranding TVET in Ghana. The establishment of strong linkages and collaboration with employers and industry is seen as a critical training provider-related strategy in the rebranding of TVET in Ghana ($\bar{x} = 4.69$, $SD = .49$).

Rebranding Strategies Related to Parents and Guardians

The parents and guardians' strategies key to the rebranding of TVET in Ghana is discussed in this section of the study. The inventory of parents and guardians' strategies is perceived as essential to the rebranding of the TVET programme in Ghana. Lobbying politicians favouring TVET was a critical parent and guardian-related strategy in the rebranding of TVET in Ghana ($\bar{x} = 4.70$, $SD = .45$). The respondents also support

activities of training providers as a critical parent and guardian-related strategy in the rebranding of TVET in Ghana ($\bar{x} = 4.65$, $SD = .47$).

Rebranding Strategies Related to Donors and Development Partners

Donors and development partners' strategies key to the rebranding of TVET in Ghana is discussed in this section. The inventory of donors and development partners strategies that were essential to the rebranding of the TVET programme in Ghana are discussed and identified through descriptive statistical analysis. Table 1 shows that the respondents esteemed the funding of TVET research and advocacy as a critical donor and development partner real partner-related the rebranding of TVET in Ghana ($\bar{x} = 4.72$, $SD = .45$). Thus, the funding of TVET research and advocacy as a donor and development partner-related strategy necessary in the rebranding of TVET in Ghana is deemed the first and most significant donor and development partner-related strategy in the quest to rebrand TVET in Ghana.

Rebranding Strategies Related to Employers

The respondents mentioned the employer strategies key to the rebranding of TVET in Ghana and perceived the provision of opportunities for industrial attachment for trainees as a critical employer-related strategy in the rebranding of TVET in Ghana ($\bar{x} = 4.70$, $SD = .43$). Furthermore, respondents acknowledged that contributing financially to the national training fund constitutes an employer-related strategy in the rebranding of TVET in Ghana ($\bar{x} = 4.65$, $SD = .47$).

The Implication of the Factors for Rebranding

TVET has been identified throughout literature as a critical means of providing quality education in the form of technology and related science and practical skills and knowledge to the youth to eradicate poverty and nurture self-reliance and a sustainable livelihood (Ogbuanya and Oluwasola 2015). It is classed as a means of wealth generation by contributing immensely to the economy through the improvement of GDP. This is achieved on account of the resultant job creation and source of employment of TVET. Over the years, various governments in Ghana, pre-colonial and post-colonial, have instituted measures to improve the economy of Ghana through education. TVE has proven to be a reliable and sustainable means of equipping the citizenry with the needed skills and employment to propel the nation's economic growth. In the government of Ghana's Vision 2020, TVET has been projected to play a major contributing role in economic growth with its emphasis on the GPRS (Ansah and Kissi 2013). However, the development of TVET in Ghana has been suppressed over the years due to various challenges. The perceived challenges hindering or obstructing the contributions of TVET to national development in Ghana include inadequate funding of the programme, poor conditions of service for teachers, derogatory remarks about TVET students/graduates, poor image and status of TVET, inadequate materials and logistics, high teacher-to-student ratios, unavailability of consumable materials for

practical, poor maintenance culture, inadequate workshops/laboratories, and supply and demand mismatch in the labour market. Thus, the challenges of TVET are more related to funding, tutor motivation and reward, poor TVET perception, the inadequacy of infrastructure and logistics, and supply and demand mismatch in the labour market.

This paper has presented various strategies that could be adopted in rebranding TVET in Ghana as TVET has been stigmatised among Ghanaians to be the only way out for the poor and the intellectually inefficient. This paper proposes five (major) rebranding strategies for the development and growth of TVE in developing and growing the subfactors of the major strategies that could lead to rebranding TVET in Ghana. Rebranding strategies related to the government were seen as the most critical strategy to rebrand TVET in Ghana. The role of government, through legislation, training given to instructors, financial support for trainees, and capacity building of the educational system in Ghana cannot be overemphasised. It was clear from the study that respondents agreed that government involvement in rebranding largely and repacking TVET in Ghana was key to its wide acceptance among the youth and citizens. Policy implementations that support TVET positively, coupled with an investment in training materials and constant monitoring and evaluation of TVE in Ghana, are identified as crucial government-related strategies to rebrand TVET.

TVE training providers in Ghana play a major role in rebranding TVET and should incorporate the development of business plans and networking in their training as well as benchmarking their training with industries and the employment market. This would help restructure the training given to technical and vocational students to adequately prepare them for and respond to the skills demanded by industry and the job market. The training provided should be adaptive to the constant and evolving demands of the Ghanaian and global markets. Strategies like introducing incentivised bursary schemes to brilliant but needy students are identified in this study as a worthwhile rebranding strategy of TVET in Ghana. These schemes and scholarships could be a source of motivation for students in TVE. Strengthening TVE students' guidance and counselling and sensitisation of the public as a rebranding strategy would eliminate stereotyping of TVET in Ghana.

It is posited that some activities of parents and guardians can be adopted in the bid to rebrand TVET in Ghana. The wrong perception of TVET being the only way out should be rejected by parents as they guide and direct their wards in choosing TVE. This would equip the youth with skills that could lead to financial independence as TVET is more geared to training individuals to be job creators than the traditional education that has promoted job-seeking. The donor and developmental partners' role in the rebranding of TVET in Ghana was identified from the study results as critical. Strategies like funding research geared towards the development of TVET, capacity building of TVET in Ghana, and advocacy initiatives to promote TVET should be advanced by donor partners in rebranding TVET. Employers' associated roles in rebranding TVET in Ghana could be numbered in this study. Work training for employees and providing

opportunities for industrial training of TVET students are critically acknowledged as crucial rebranding strategies of TVET in Ghana.

The major stakeholders of education in Ghana (the government, trainers and tutors, parents and guardians, donor and development partners, and employers), like in other countries, have critical roles in rebranding TVET to enhance its wide acceptance as a key and essential means of education and training in Ghana as identified by this paper. The study results showed that all the major stakeholders identified must vigorously pursue their various interests and roles in TVET. The mean scores' rank of the various strategies showed a very high significance of the strategies identified by this paper to be critical to rebranding TVET in Ghana. The low standard deviations recorded depict a low variation among the responses, indicating a high agreement of the strategies identified in rebranding TVET in Ghana.

The findings of this study are also relevant to ordinary Ghanaians who are the major beneficiaries of TVET. When TVET is rebranded, it will improve its acceptance among the youth and parents alike. Government and donor agencies would focus more attention on and funding to TVET in Ghana, and policies would be directed towards implementing TVET, coupled with constant monitoring and evaluation to improve the mode of instructional delivery of TVET in Ghana. This would resultantly lead to a skills-based labour force which would reduce the unemployment rate in Ghana as TVET is inclined to job creation as opposed to job-seeking. TVET, when rebranded, would feed the industry the needed skills rather than redundant skills. Rebranding TVET aligns with the government policy of building a Ghana beyond aid through industrialisation. The one-district one-factory policy of the Ghanaian government would be very successful when TVET is rebranded to provide skilled labour to the various factories to be set up with the needed skills. Therefore, the results of this study are vital to policymakers, donor agencies, economic sectors in Ghana, industry players, and the ordinary Ghanaian.

Conclusions

This study identified five major stakeholder strategies in rebranding TVET in Ghana to minimise the effects of the challenges and enhance the acceptance among Ghanaians as a means of education and training favourable to economic development and poverty reduction through a reduction of the unemployment rate prevalent in the country. Strategies related to the government were identified as the most significant and critical for rebranding TVET in Ghana. Rebranding strategies related to training providers, parents and guardians, and donor and development partners were identified from the study results to be critical to TVET in Ghana. The role of employers in rebranding TVET in Ghana was also identified to be very significant in this study. TVET education in Ghana was designed and implemented as part of the educational system of Ghana to reduce the high rate of unemployment in Ghana. Yet, this goal of TVET education is far from being achieved partly due to the poor nature of the programme design,

ineffectiveness of the trainers and delivery system, poor content and curriculum, and poor entrepreneurial knowledge and interest of educators. There is an inadequate local partnership in the design of TVET education in Ghana. The system for producing educators or tutors for the TVET programme is ineffective as practitioners and consultants are less involved in the design of the TVET programme. The course content and curriculum are also bereft of entrepreneurial skills development as they lack the development of trainees' marketing, leadership and teamwork, strategic planning, and socio-emotional skills. Thus, the level of contribution of the TVET educational programme to national development in Ghana is highly minimal.

Despite the contributions of the study, some limitations still exist. The study was based on TVET in Ghana, making the generalisability of the study findings limited. Nonetheless, the lessons in the study could be useful in developing TVET in other countries, especially in sub-Saharan Africa which shares similar characteristics with Ghana. Also, the study was purely quantitative. Future studies might consider a mixed-methods analysis of quantitative and qualitative techniques to understand the dynamics of rebranding TVET in Ghana and elsewhere.

References

- Abdullahi, H., Y. Z. Abdullahi, and A. A. Bello. 2012. "Rebranding Nigeria's Educational System for Effective National Economic Development." *Academic Research International* 3 (1): 186–193.
- Adams, A. V. 2007. *The Role of Youth Skills Development in the Transition to Work: A Global Review*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
<https://documents1.worldbank.org/curated/zh/533301468088460383/pdf/406440REPLACEM0110USE0SAME0BOX0INFO.pdf>
- African Transformation Report (ATR). 2014. *Growth with Depth*. The African Center for Economic Transformation.
https://acetforafrica.org/?smd_process_download=1&download_id=14456
- African Union. 2007. "Strategy to Revitalize Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) in Africa." Addis Ababa: African Union.
https://au.int/sites/default/files/documents/39018-doc-15._au_2007_tvete_strategy.pdf
- Agbenyo, J. S. 2010. "ICT, Technical and Vocational Training in Ghana, Telecentres African Rural Community Services Delivery." *International Journal of Elementary Education* 8 (3): 58–62.
- Alam, G. M. 2008. "The Role of Technical and Vocational Education in National Development of Bangladesh." *Asia-Pacific Journal of Co-operative Education* 9 (1): 30–33.

- Almeida, R., L. Anazawa, N. M. Filho, and L. Vasconcellos. 2015. *Investing in Technical & Vocational Education and Training: Does it Yield Large Economic Returns in Brazil?*. The World Bank. <https://doi.org/10.1596/1813-9450-7246>
- Amedorme, S. K., and Y. A. K. Fiagbe. 2013. "Challenges Facing Technical and Vocational Education in Ghana." *International Journal of Scientific & Technology Research* 2 (6): 253–255.
- Ansah, S. K., and E. Kissi. 2013. "Technical and Vocational Education and Training in Ghana: A Tool for Skill Acquisition and Industrial Development." *Journal of Education and Practice* 4 (16): 172–180.
- Appiah-Kwapong, L. S., H. B. Taylor-Abdulai, C. O. Nyarko, C. Ampofo-Ansa, E. Donkor, and E. O. Afriyie. 2017. "Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) as Catalyst for Entrepreneurial Development of Students in Polytechnics: A Case Study of Accra Polytechnic." *Higher Education Research* 2 (2): 55–59.
- Aryeetey, A., E. Bortei-Doku, D. Doh, and P. Andoh. 2011. "From Prejudice to Prestige: Vocational Education and Training in Ghana." City and Guilds and Centre for Skills Development Council for Technical and Vocational Education and Training (COTVET). <http://hdl.voced.edu.au/10707/179756>
- Atchoarena, D., and A. Delluc. 2001. *Revisiting Technical and Vocational Education in Sub-Saharan Africa: An Update on Trends, Innovations and Challenges*. Paris: International Institute for Educational Planning, World Bank. <https://aau.org/wp-content/uploads/sites/9/2018/04/Technical-Vocational-Education-in-SSA-Trends-innovations-and-Challenges.pdf>
- Ayonmike, C. S. 2016. "Technical Vocational Education and Training in Nigeria for Job Creation and Wealth Generation: Myths and Realities." *ATBU, Journal of Science, Technology & Education (JOSTE)* 4 (2): 1–9.
- Ayonmike, C. S., D. Okuwele, and B. C. Okeke. 2013. "Towards Quality Technical Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Programmes in Nigeria: Challenges and Improvement Strategies." NVETA 2013 Conference, Las Vegas, Nevada, USA.
- Ayonmike, C. S., and B. C. Okeke. 2018. "Making Technical Vocational Education and Training First Career Choice in Africa: What Can Stakeholders Do Differently?" Paper presented at the 2018 International Vocational Education and Training Association (IVETA) World TVET Conference, August 13–16, Cape Town, South Africa.
- Ayua, T. S., and D. A. Nerkar. 2004. "Technical and Vocational Education for Self-Reliance in Contemporary Nigeria Society." *Benue State University Journal of Education* 1 (1): 25–27.
- Baah-Boateng, W., and D. Baffour-Awuah. 2015. "Skills Development for Economic Transformation in Ghana." African Centre for Economic Transformation. <https://includeplatform.net/wp-content/uploads/2020/01/GTF-Skills-Development-in-Ghana-SR-formatted.compressed-1.pdf>

- Baffour-Awuah, D., and S. Thompson. 2012. "A Holistic Approach to Technical and Vocational Skills Development (TVSD) Policy and Governance Reform: The Case of Ghana." ADEA Triennale. <https://www.adeanet.org/clearinghouse/en/holistic-approach-technical-and-vocational-skills-development-tvsd-policy-and-governance-reform-case>
- Banerjee, A., and S. Chaudhury. 2010. "Statistics without Tears: Populations and Samples." *Industrial Psychiatry Journal* 19 (1): 60–65. <https://doi.org/10.4103/0972-6748.77642>
- Bewaji, J. I. 2013. "A Depressing Story on the Disconnect between Nigeria Tertiary Institutions and the Reality of Life after Graduation." Rise Networks. Accessed May 7, 2014. www.risenetworks.org
- Chan, A. P., D. W. Chan, and K. S. Ho. 2003. "Partnering in Construction: Critical Study of Problems for Implementation." *Journal of Management in Engineering* 19 (3): 126–135. [https://doi.org/10.1061/\(ASCE\)0742-597X\(2003\)19:3\(126\)](https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)0742-597X(2003)19:3(126))
- Dzeto, K. G. 2014. "Projecting Ghana into the Real Middle-Income Economy: The Role of Technical, Vocational Education Training." Parliamentary Briefing Paper, Friedrich Ebert Stiftung, Ghana. <https://library.fes.de/pdf-files/bueros/ghana/11300.pdf>
- Enyekit, E. O., and K. S. Enyenihi. 2007. "Projecting Nigeria into the End of the First Quarter (25) Years of the 21st Century in Vocational Technical Education." *African Journal of Education and Research Development* 1 (1): 2–8.
- Essel, O. Q., E. Agyarkoh, M. S. Sumaila, and P. D. Yankson. 2014. "TVET Stigmatization in Developing Countries: Reality or Fallacy?" *European Journal of Training and Development Studies* 1 (1): 27–42.
- European Centre for the Development of Vocational Training. 2013. *Benefits of Vocational Education and Training in Europe for People, Organisations and Countries*. Luxembourg: Publications Office of the European Union. <https://doi.org/10.2801/18161>
- European Commission. 2013. *The Effectiveness and Costs-Benefits of Apprenticeships: Results of the Quantitative Analysis*. Brussels: European Commission.
- Glick, P. J., C. Huang, and N. Mejia. 2015. *The Private Sector and Youth Skills and Employment Programs in Low- and Middle-Income Countries*. Washington, DC: World Bank.
- GPE and UNESCO International Institution for Educational Planning. 2015. "Guidelines for Education Sector Plan Preparation." Accessed November 18, 2019. www.globalpartnership.org/content/guidelines-education-sector-plan-preparation
- Hanushek, E. A., G. Schwerdt, L. Woessmann, and L. Zhang. 2017. "General Education, Vocational Education and Labor Market Outcomes over the Life-Cycle." *Journal of Human Resources* 52 (1): 48–87. <https://doi.org/10.3368/jhr.52.1.0415-7074R>

- Idris, A., and Y. Mbudai. 2017. "Technical and Vocational Education: Challenges towards Youths Empowerment in Kano State-Nigeria." *Journal of Technical Education and Training (JTET)* 9 (1): 1–12.
- Kemavor, A. K., and J. K. Kassah. 2015. "Challenges of Technical and Vocational Education and Training and Educational Stakeholders in the Volta Region of Ghana." *International Journal of Humanities Social Sciences and Education (IJHSSE)* 2 (6): 70–79.
- Kim, B. M. 2013. "Estimating Returns to Vocational Education at High Schools in Korea." Department of Economics, University of Southern California. Accessed November 21, 2017. https://dornsife.usc.edu/assets/sites/474/docs/BoMKim_2013_vh.pdf
- King, K., and R. Palmer. 2010. *Planning for Technical and Vocational Skills Development*. Paris: UNESCO, International Institute for Educational Planning.
- Kissi, E., D. K. Ahadzie, C. Debrah, and T. Adjei-Kumi. 2020. "Underlying Strategies for Improving Entrepreneurial Skills Development of Technical and Vocational Students in Developing Countries: Using Ghana as a Case Study." *Education + Training* 62 (5): 599–614. <https://doi.org/10.1108/ET-11-2019-0264>
- Lawal, A. W. 2010. "Re-branding Vocational and Technical in Nigeria for Sustainable National Development, Problems and Prospect." Paper presented at the 1st National Conference of School of Business Education, Federal College of Education (Technical) Bichi, November 1–4, 2010.
- Lawal, W. A. 2013. "Technical and Vocational Education, a Tool for National Development in Nigeria." *Mediterranean Journal of Social Sciences* 4 (8): 85–89. <https://doi.org/10.5901/mjss.2013.v4n8p85>
- Maclean, R., and M. Pavlova. 2013. "Vocationalization of Secondary and Higher Education: Pathways to the World of Work." In *Revisiting Global Trends in TVET: Reflections on Theory and Practice*, edited by UNESCO-UNEVOC, 40–85. Bonn: UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre for Technical and Vocational Education and Training.
- Maiga, E. 2013. "Making Skills Development Work for Economic Transformation in Africa: Demystifying the Suit and De-Stigmatizing Vocational and Technical Education." Addis Ababa, Ethiopia: National Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) Strategy. <http://acetforafrica.org/making-skills-developmentwork-for-economic-transformation-in-africa-demystifying-the-suit-and-de-stigmatizingvocational-and-technical-education/06-2013/>
- Mao, C., Q. Shen, W. Pan, and K. Ye. 2015. "Major Barriers to Off-Site Construction: The Developer's Perspective in China." *Journal of Management in Engineering* 31 (3): 04014043. [https://doi.org/10.1061/\(ASCE\)ME.1943-5479.0000246](https://doi.org/10.1061/(ASCE)ME.1943-5479.0000246)
- McGrath, S. 2012. "Vocational Education and Training for Development: A Policy in Need of a Theory?" *International Journal of Educational Development* 32 (5) 623–631.

- McWilliam, H. O. A., and F. A. Kwamena-Poh. 1975. *The Development of Education in Ghana*. London: Longman.
- Ministry of Education. 2018. "Education Sector Analysis 2018." Accessed November 16, 2019. <http://saphana.com/data/documents/Ghana-Education-Sector-Analysis-2018.pdf>
- Mohammed, B. 2020. "Challenges TVET Graduates Face during School to Work Transition in Selected Technical Universities in Ghana." *Journal of Arts and Humanities* 9 (6): 112–123.
- Neuman, S., and A. Ziderman. 1999. "Vocational Education in Israel: Wage Effects of the VocEd-Occupation Match." *Journal of Human Resources* 34 (2): 407–420. <https://doi.org/10.2307/146351>
- Ning, F., and T. Shunde. 2013. "Innovations in Workforce Training Programs in Ghana Using Pay for Performance Contract." M-RCBG Associate Working Paper Series No. 20, Harvard University. https://live.hks.harvard.edu/sites/default/files/centers/mrcbg/files/Fu_Tu_Final.pdf
- Nwosu, J. C., and E. M. Micah. 2017. "Technical and Vocational Education and Training as a Tool for National Sustainable Development in Nigeria." *The International Journal of Social Sciences and Humanities Invention* 4 (9): 3983–3988. <https://doi.org/10.18535/ijsshi/v4i9.14>
- Odoom, S. K., E. K. Payne, and D. A. Boateng. 2016. "Prospects of TVET for Ghana's Industrial Development." *American Journal of Engineering Research (AJER)* 5 (7): 280–285.
- Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development (OECD). 2017. *Latin American Economic Outlook 2017: Youth, Skills and Entrepreneurship*. Paris: OECD. https://www.oecd-ilibrary.org/development/latin-american-economic-outlook-2017_leo-2017-en
- Ogbonda, L., and K. K. Wobi. 2016. "Management Challenges of Technical and Vocational Education in Nigeria for National Development." *International Journal of Education and Evaluation* 2 (6): 42–55.
- Ogbuanya, T. C., and A. J. Oluwasola. 2015. "Quality Technical, Vocational Education and Training: A Tool for Self-Reliance." *IOSR Journal of Computer Engineering (IOSR-JCE)* 17 (1): 30–35.
- Oketch, M. O. 2007. "To Vocationalise or Not to Vocationalise? Perspectives on Current Trends and Issues in Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) in Africa." *International Journal of Educational Development* 27 (2): 220–234. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2006.07.004>

- Onderi, H., J. Ajowi, and G. Malala. 2014. "Restructuring Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) For Sustainable Development in Sub-Saharan Africa." *International Journal of Interdisciplinary Research and Innovations* 2 (1): 40–45.
- Palmer, R. 2009. "Skills Development, Employment and Sustained Growth in Ghana: Sustainability Challenges." *International Journal of Educational Development* 29 (2): 133–139. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2008.09.007>
- Palmer, R. 2014. "Technical and Vocational Skills and Post-2015: Avoiding Another Vague Skills Goal?" *International Journal of Educational Development* 39: 32–39. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ijedudev.2014.08.007>
- Plecher, H. 2019. "Ghana: Youth Unemployment Rate from 2008 to 2018." Accessed June 27, 2019. <https://www.statista.com/statistics/812039/youth-unemployment-rate-in-ghana/>
- Ryan, P. 2001. "The School-to-Work Transition: A Cross-National Perspective." *Journal of Economic Literature* 39 (1): 34–92. <https://doi.org/10.1257/jel.39.1.34>
- United Nations Educational, Scientific and Cultural Organization (UNESCO). 1984. "Policy Planning and Administration of Technical and Vocational Education in Ghana." Paris: UNESCO. <https://unesdoc.unesco.org/ark:/48223/pf0000060985.locale=en>
- World Bank. 2017. "Fiscal Consolidation to Accelerate Growth and Support Inclusive Development: Ghana Public Expenditure Review." Accessed November 16, 2019. <https://openknowledge.worldbank.org/handle/10986/27558>