

AN APPRAISAL OF SOURCE MATERIAL FOR THE STUDY OF TARGUM MINOR PROPHETS

Gudrun Lier & Anna Fransina van Zyl

Department of Applied Communicative Skills
University of Johannesburg
Bunting Road Campus
Auckland Park 2006
South Africa

E-mail: gelier@uj.ac.za; vanzyl.amelia@gmail.com
(Received 09/10/2015; Accepted 26/10/2015)

ABSTRACT

The study of Aramaic Bible translations (Targumim) continues to be a valuable source of information, not only for uncovering the history of biblical interpretation but also for providing insights for the study of linguistics and translation techniques. In comparison with work done on the Pentateuchal Targumim and Targum Former Prophets, research on the individual books of Targum Minor Prophets has been scant. By providing an overview of selected source material this review seeks (i) to provide incentives for more focussed studies in the field of Targum Minor Prophets and (ii) to motivate new integrated research approaches which are now made possible with the assistance of highly developed software programmes.

INTRODUCTION

Aramaic translation of the Hebrew Bible, referred to as *Targum*, played a decisive role within the exegetical history of formative Judaism (Bowker 2008:14–16). The Targumim not only assisted rabbinic scholars to understand, interpret, and contemporise complex passages of Scripture in line with other interpretative traditions of rabbinic Judaism, but they also contributed to the overall redactional process of Jewish religious traditions (cf. *b. Mo'ed Qaṭ.* 28b; *b. Meg.* 3a; *b. Sanh.* 94b) (Bacher 1899:651–655).

The study of Aramaic Bible translations (Targumim) continues to remain a source of valuable information, not only for its assistance in uncovering the history of biblical

interpretation but also for its value in the study of linguistics and translation techniques (cf. Flesher & Chilton 2011). Within the field of Targum studies, the prophetic Targum, also referred to as *Targum Jonathan to the Prophets*, is an important field of research.¹ This Targum is subdivided into Targum Former Prophets and Targum Latter Prophets. Targum Latter Prophets is again subdivided into Targum Major Prophets (Isaiah, Jeremiah, and Ezekiel) and Targum Minor Prophets (Hosea, Joel, Amos, Obadiah, Jonah, Micah, Nahum, Habakkuk, Zephaniah, Haggai, Zechariah, and Malachi). While Targum Isaiah (Chilton 1987), Targum Jeremiah (Hayward 1987), and Targum Ezekiel (Levey 1987) have received individual attention, there is currently still ample research scope relating to the books of Targum Minor Prophets.

With respect to research on Targumim, CAL has a bibliographic archive, which contains additions up to the year 2000 of *An Aramaic bibliography, Part I, Old, Official, and Biblical Aramaic* by Joseph, Fitzmyer, and Kaufman (1992). Regrettably, since the last bibliographical update of the CAL in 2000, only a limited number of new works have been added, because funding shortfalls have made it difficult to maintain the comprehensiveness of this archive.

The focus of this review is on some of the latest contributions to Targum research by assessing their methodologies, significance and centrality to the topic of Targum studies as well as their availability in print and e-book format (cf. Zemliansky 2008:1). Key search terms in this contribution include Targum, Targumist, Minor Prophets, Latter Prophets, Aramaic and rabbinic Judaism; lexical analysis, grammar, syntax and semantics, translation and translation techniques.

Apart from pointing out relevant source material for the study of Targum Minor Prophets, the purpose of this review is to identify current gaps in the field of Targum studies to inspire new integrated research approaches for this field of research (cf. Cronin, Ryan & Coughlan 2008:38). This contribution may also assist researchers to determine or define research questions or hypotheses. The overall aim is to bring the reader up to date with electronic databases and selected literature sources which

¹ See Flesher & Chilton's (2011:197–198; 227–228) short bibliographical overview.

currently are available for the study of Targum and specifically Targum Minor Prophets.

METHODOLOGY

This review follows a traditional or narrative approach (cf. Cronin, Ryan & Coughlan 2008:38). From a broad perspective it aims to focus on sources which relate to the study of Targum. For the sake of succinctness, however, the approach is selective, to facilitate the summarising and synthesising of a volume of literature that is more or less particular to the subject of Targum Minor Prophets (see Cronin, Ryan & Coughlan 2008:38). In other words, the review will point out and distinguish between sources that speak to the study of Targum as a whole and those that focus on Targum Minor Prophets more specifically.

In the approach, the focus first is on electronic databases and software programmes, which assist with the retrieval of primary sources and the collection of archival and historical material. Relevant computer packages and Bible software tools are pointed out and discussed for their ability to perform keyword searches for the collection of data and exploration of subject-specific foci. Within this discussion, essential current studies on aspects of grammar and linguistics are highlighted for guidance in comparative textual, linguistic and exegetical studies. In the same vein, the existing body of knowledge is re-examined in the light of new developments. The selected sources are summarised and weighed up in relation to how their positions and approaches have contributed to various topics in the broad study of Targum and the value of these approaches for a research focus specific to Targum Minor Prophets (cf. Hart 2014).

With respect to the discussion of secondary sources, these will be described with regard to their design and purpose, analysis of theories or concepts associated with the topic, review boundaries, synthesis of studies as well as key thoughts and definitions. The literature is presented chronologically, to show how the study of Targum is evolving; within that approach sources relating to the study of Aramaic are also discussed, since these two topics are interrelated.

ELECTRONIC SOURCES DEALING WITH THE STUDY OF TARGUM

Online databases provide easy access to Targum source texts while Bible software programmes have made it possible to accurately retrieve source texts from the Hebrew Scriptures and Targum modules. Currently, *The Comprehensive Aramaic Lexicon Project* (CAL) managed by Stephen A. Kaufman is advocated as the most prominent source for the study of Aramaic because of its comprehensive text base of Aramaic texts and its ability to authenticate the specific dialect of lexemes used in the various Aramaic texts. All other available software programmes relating to Targum studies have either been developed in partnership with the CAL or derive their Targum files from the CAL. For this reason the discussion below of electronic sources relating to Targum studies starts with a detailed introduction of the CAL database and then continues by pointing out various software programmes, which have Targum modules either included in their package or which are available as add-ons.

The Comprehensive Aramaic Lexicon Project (CAL)

The CAL is a text base of Aramaic texts dating from the ninth century B.C.E. through the thirteenth century C.E. Its current database consists of approximately 3 million lexically parsed words and an associated set of electronic tools for analysing and manipulating the data (<http://cal1.cn.huc.edu>). Since 1986, recent new discoveries of inscriptions, papyri, scrolls, and fragments are regularly and systematically updated in CAL with modern systems of accuracy. CAL's relevance can mainly be attributed to its sustained support for scholars in that (i) it aims to cover all dialects and periods of ancient Aramaic, not just selected portions; (ii) it does not only take into account existing dictionaries but is based on a new and thorough compilation of all Aramaic literature and (iii) it takes account of all modern scholarly discussions of the Aramaic language.

CAL enables the researcher to search various lexical and textual databases. These include a 'Lexical Browse Function' and 'Other Research Tools'. The 'Lexical Browse Function' enables scholars to search for English glosses, look for combinations of English words within citations as well as citations from texts not in

the CAL online database, and to conduct text browses. ‘Other Research Tools’ provides access to the Targum Studies Module, Concordance tools, the Basic Concordance of a single text, Create a KWIC of Multiple Text Number(s), BINARY Search and Dictionary Spelling Collation. The CAL database allows users easy access to the text, select a word, and with the click of the mouse, see its phrasing and corresponding entry. The “KWIC” function is particularly useful to create a concordance for a word in the Aramaic lexicon since it enables one to easily search entire dialects through the identification of a specific lemma. CAL also contains a comprehensive archive of bibliographic resources whereby bibliographic files can be searched by author, by text, by subject or by lexical item.

CAL has had a tremendous impact on the field of biblical studies and has become an indispensable part of a number of other Bible software programmes. Its particular relevance for the study of Targum Minor Prophets lies in its readily available and easily accessible texts for the various Targum modules. Its multiple functions allow researchers to attempt and develop integrated new research approaches.

Logos [6]

The Targums from the Files of the Comprehensive Aramaic is part of a Logos Bible software programme, which has been developed in partnership with the CAL (<https://www.logos.com/product/7862/the-targums-from-the-files-of-the-comprehensive-aramaic-lexicon-project>). This software runs on Windows, Mac and mobile and is available for download for off-line users of the CAL database.

The programme holds a new dictionary of ancient Aramaic, which covers all dialects of the language. It includes a comprehensive selection of Targumim from the CAL files and a Targum lexicon generated as a subset of the larger CAL lexicon as well as concordances. Every word in these texts is linked to an entry in CAL through a lexical form tag, taking all citations into account. Homograph numbers help to distinguish between different words that share the same lexical forms. The programme also indicates parts of speech and other basic morphology tags. Variant Targum readings are displayed in an interlinear format whereby the various Targums can be

linked with each other and with the Hebrew or English Bibles. Other features include the run of comparison reports between the Targums, exegetical guides, and lemma reports.

The Logos Bible software programme has contributed greatly to the advancement of Targum studies by providing an off-line edition, which is easy to use.

BibleWorks [10]

Another primary source for Targum research is the BibleWorks software for biblical exegesis and research. BibleWorks 10 comes with a base package of focused tools and key resources (and a small number of additional databases as add-on resources) to assist with the exegesis of the Biblical text.

In view of Targum research, it contains the following comprehensive Aramaic base texts with morphology, which are derived from the Hebrew Union College CAL project: Fragment Targums, Targum SheniSuppEsther, Targum Tosefta Prophets, Targum Cairo Geniza, Targum Neofiti, Targum Neofiti Marginalia, Targum Pseudo-Jonathan as well as updated versions (2005) of Targum Onkelos and Targum Jonathan. English translations of Rodkinson's Babylonian Talmud and Mishnah, Psalms Targum, Targum Jerusalem on the Pentateuch (Etheridge trans.), Targum Onkelos on the Pentateuch (Etheridge trans.) and Targum Pseudo-Jonathan on the Pentateuch (Etheridge trans.) are available. The Targum variants in BibleWorks 10 are tagged and also distinguished by colour.

This software comes with extensive texts tools which allow texts to be searched for words, partial words, and phrases including lexical, grammatical, phrase, semantic domain, related verse and key word in context searches. Texts can be read in parallel columns, vertical comparative lines, or full context. An easy morphology search is enabled from a popup list of morphology codes which opens as you type morphological codes. Details for Aramaic words can be accessed from moving the mouse cursor over a word to see complete lemmatisation, parsing, and definition for Aramaic words displayed from the Holladay, Hebrew and Aramaic Lexicon of the OT (HOL).

BibleWorks10 was developed to assist with conducting intertextual analyses and comparing Hebrew lexemes in the biblical books with their Aramaic counterparts in Targum of the Minor Prophets.

Accordance [11]

A Bible software programme that offers Targum files as add-on packages (as provided by CAL) together with full morphological tagging and glosses, is Accordance (<http://www.accordancebible.com>). These add-on packages run on Mac, Windows, and mobile. They contain the Aramaic modules of the Targum Onkelos and Targum Jonathan completely pointed, the full texts of Targum Neofiti and Targum Pseudo-Jonathan completely tagged, the Targum of the Writings (viz. Psalms, Job, Proverbs, Ruth, Qohelet, Song of Songs, Esther, Lamentations and Chronicles), Targum fragments of the Torah, Targum manuscripts of the Torah from the Cairo Geniza as well as English translations of Targum Onkelos and Targum Neofiti (Eldon Clem trans.), a revised translation of Targum Onkelos, Targum Jonathan to Joshua, Judges, 1 & 2 Samuel and Hosea, and a translation of Targum Pseudo-Jonathan.

SECONDARY SOURCES ON TARGUM STUDIES

Secondary sources discussed in this section include important classic works as well as more recent research studies on Targum Jonathan to the Prophets. Among these only a few focus on Targum Minor Prophets in particular. Nevertheless, additional works are highlighted for their support in providing a broad base for the study of Targum Minor Prophets. Similarly, current contributions in the form of journal articles are pointed out.

Pinkhos Churgin (1927)

With his comprehensive study on *Targum Jonathan to the Prophets*, Churgin (1927) paved the way for future researchers on the prophetic Targum (cf. Gordon 1994:9). Churgin not only looks at the historical background and textual variations of the

prophetic Targum; he also discusses exegetical issues, points out general peculiarities, and identifies interpolated Targum and additions. These aspects continue to provide relevant parameters for current studies.

While other scholars used the study of Targum as background to the Gospels, Churgin recognised Targum as a source of rabbinic teachings (Fraade 1985:392). Further, in his reconstruction of the history of Targum Jonathan, Churgin gives thorough attention to questions of authorship and redaction. He does not trace the origins of Targum Jonathan back to the Second Temple period. Instead, through his identification of historical allusions, Churgin concludes that the extant text consists of different translation traditions which developed over a period of time, and although he differentiates some changes as of Babylonian origin, his view is that the redactional growth of this Targum happened over a long period of time from 165 B.C.E. to the early second century with no single author or redactor (cf. Fraade 1985:393, 396; Smelik 1995:45–46).

The enduring value of Churgin's contribution lies in his provision of a general overview of Targum Jonathan's translation style, its theological concepts, and historical background (cf. Van Staaldune-Sulman 2002:20). Albeit not all modern researchers share Churgin's points of view, his research continues to serve as stimulus for new insights. Churgin's book is readily available not only in print but also online in PDF format for free download.

Alexander Sperber (1962–1992)

Sperber's epic four part Targum edition *The Bible in Aramaic based on old manuscripts and printed texts, I-IVB* (1992), which stretches over a period of four decades (1962–1992), is synonymous with Targum studies. The 1992 edition not only reflects his personal growth in the area of Targum studies but also the gradual development of Targum studies in the modern era. In his comparison of the Masoretic Text with Targum Jonathan, Sperber discovered several inherent translation techniques. In his 1973 study, Sperber highlights many variants between Targum manuscripts which led him to explore the motives for such textual deviations. He

concludes that there were two schools of translators at work in Targum Jonathan: one school adhering to a literal translation of the biblical text, and the other handling the text quite freely.

Although Sperber's findings in this four part volume were not a totally innovative discovery in Targum research, his classifications proved to be more systematic and detailed than those identified by his predecessors (Van Staaldune-Sulman 2002:29–30). Notwithstanding problems with Sperber's organisation and comparison of secondary manuscripts, his contribution remains a major resource of old and new ideas for Targum studies (cf. Gordon 1974:314–321; Gordon 1994:152; Van Staaldune-Sulman 2002:32). Sperber's 1992 edition is available in print but not in e-book format.

Leivy Smolar and Moses Aberbach (1983)

In Smolar and Aberbach's *Studies in Targum Jonathan to the Prophets* (1983) they provide a detailed and systematic synthesis of major theological concepts prevalent in Targum Jonathan. The study is a first attempt to identify rabbinic parallels in Targum Prophets. Continuing in the footsteps of Churgin, Smolar and Aberbach recognise even more historical allusions and begin to compile a theological profile for Targum Jonathan. In differentiation from previous research on Targum Prophets, Smolar and Aberbach (1983:xxix) provide a synthesis of important theological concepts such as God, God and man, idolatry, fear of God and sin, Torah and good deeds, prayer, reward and punishment, divine justice relating to individuals, to nations in general and Israel in particular, and mysticism and eschatology. The descriptive style of this synthesis sets it off against that of their predecessors. In Ho's assessment (2009:411–416), these theological concepts are of pronounced value for identifying and defining theological periods or ideological perspectives as well as specific schools of thought in Targum Minor Prophets. Against this Fraade (1985:396) offers a word of caution regarding Smolar and Aberbach's proposed synthesis of Targum Minor Prophets' theology with rabbinic parallels. Fraade's argument is that the different historical and social contexts of extant documents have to be taken into account, something which Smolar and Aberbach failed to pay appropriate attention to.

There is a need to develop typologies whereby the exegetical methods of Targum Minor Prophets are described in line with the rendering of the Hebrew text and how this rendering incorporates rabbinic teachings (cf. Van Staaldoune-Sulman 2002:40). Such typologies may help to determine the intellectual and social function of this Targum within the age of formative Judaism. This book is available in print but not in e-book format.

Kevin Cathcart and Robert Gordon (1989)

Cathcart and Gordon's (1989) translation of *The Targum of the Minor Prophets* from Aramaic into English paved the way for more focussed and extensive research in the field of the Targum Minor Prophets. Included in this volume are the books of Hosea, Joel, Amos, Obadiah, Jonah, Micah, Nahum, Habakkuk, Zephaniah, Haggai, Zechariah, and Malachi.

The comprehensive critical introduction provides a solid guideline for the discussion of various topics such as translation characteristics, theology, life-setting, text and versions, language, rabbinic citations and parallels and dating as well as ancient manuscript editions. The particular value of Cathcart and Gordon's work lies in an exact verse-by-verse English translation which preserves the peculiar nature of the original Aramaic renderings of the Minor Prophets. Moreover the translations are accompanied by manuscript apparatus and notes. A select bibliography (pp. 20–25) and a series of indexes (pp. 241–259) provide important guidelines for more focussed studies on individual books of Targum Minor Prophets.

This volume is available in print and also in the Logos edition where it is enhanced by navigational search functionality, linking Scripture citations directly to English translations, and important terms to dictionaries, encyclopaedias, and a wealth of other resources in the Logos digital library.

Robert Gordon (1994)

In his *Studies in the Targum to the Twelve Prophets*, Gordon (1994) makes use of an eclectic approach to establish the origin and early history of the Targum Minor

Prophets. He does not limit his inquiry to a particular theme or a specific prophet in the corpus of Targum Minor Prophets. Through this segmented approach, Gordon (1994:152) aims not only to lay bare interconnectedness but also to reveal differences. For Gordon, events and developments in the Hebrew text can be observed from the way Scripture is rendered in Targum (cf. Gordon 1994:40–61). From matching Targum traditions against Jewish and Christian writings, Gordon seeks to identify theological and ideological standpoints.

Gordon's multi-faceted approach, which reveals stratified elements representing several centuries of targumic development, may serve as incentive for the development of a new integrated research methodology in Targum studies. This book is available in print.

Willem Smelik (1995)

Another valuable source for the study of Targum Minor Prophets is Smelik's study *The Targum of the Judges* (1995). Although the study pertains to Targum Former Prophets, Smelik's overview of the various dialects of Targum Jonathan is valuable for investigations into questions of dialect in Targum of the Minor Prophets. Smelik thoroughly re-visits the early history and character of Targum Jonathan and suggests that it was used for private study, synagogue as well as school and academy (1995:25). His investigation of the various manuscripts of Targum Judges and their respective placement among the ancient translations may provide information on the manuscripts of Targum Minor Prophets. Smelik's (1995:632) concluding commentary on Targum Judges contributes to the growing corpus of notes and commentaries in the field of Targum studies and may be useful for drawing comparisons with the Targum Minor Prophets to establish interconnectedness or interdependence between the different Targumim. Smelik's book is a Brill publication and currently available in print format only.

Eveline Van Staalduine-Sulman (2002)

A further significant secondary source for any investigation of the separate books in

Targum Jonathan is the relatively recent work of Van Staaldouine-Sulman (2002), *The Targum of Samuel*. Her ground-breaking work on Targum Samuel has set a new trend in the study of the individual books of the Prophetic Targum.

In her study, Van Staaldouine-Sulman offers a comprehensive and systematic analysis of Targum Samuel in terms of a translation approach. Her research aims to address a dual purpose (2002:2): (i) To catalogue the exegetical techniques and their underlying motives, theological or otherwise, and to explain the deviations from the source text as meaningful; furthermore, (ii) to relate the exegetical traditions of Targum Samuel to Jewish sources – whether in the Talmudic and Midrashic tradition, or written down in older works such as the Pseudepigrapha, Josephus, the New Testament or Pseudo-Philo – and, if possible, to recover the date and place of origin of these traditions. Van Staaldouine-Sulman admits that her exegesis of Targum Samuel does not describe Targum Jonathan in general (2002:2). This pertains to the fact that her research does not per se speak to the case of the Targum Minor Prophets within the large compendium of Targum Jonathan. Furthermore, her work does not specifically focus on an investigation of various manuscripts from a variety of sources such as Ho (2009). Nonetheless, a study of Targum of the Minor Prophets cannot be ventured into without giving consideration to the work of Van Staaldouine-Sulman regarding general translation matters and exegetical techniques. This volume is a Brill publication and available in print and e-book format.

Bilingual concordance to the Targum of the Prophets (2006)

The *Bilingual (Aramaic-Hebrew) concordance to the Targum of the Prophets* (De Moor 2006) is a 21-volume reference work which sets out in parallel meaningful quotations from the Prophetic Targum (target text) as found in Sperber's edition and the Hebrew text of the *Biblia Hebraica Stuttgartensia* (source text), listing the Aramaic and corresponding Hebrew lemmas. All major variants listed by Sperber are incorporated in this concordance. According to Houtman and de Moor (2005:3), the concordance includes all content words, with the exception of personal names and toponyms. Further, some frequent particles were omitted from the concordance, since

their inclusion did not seem to be useful.

The concordance is published per book of the Prophets, each with a Hebrew-Aramaic index. Its aim is to make largely unknown material accessible to researchers for the textual criticism and history of interpretation of the Hebrew Bible. Targum Minor Prophets are treated in volume 18 (י–כ), volume 19 (כ–ל) and volume 20 (ל–ש). The concordance has not yet appeared in electronic format but separate printed copies per book of the Prophets are available.

Ahuva Ho (2009)

A recent secondary source with specific relevance for Targum Minor Prophets is Ho's (2009) study *The Targum of Zephaniah: manuscripts and commentary*. In her introduction, Ho includes information on the nature of Targum Jonathan as a whole in order to establish its identity as well as problems of translation and the overall function of the Prophetic Targum. The main emphasis of Ho's study falls on various manuscripts from a variety of sources for their Aramaic text to Zephaniah. Yet, the actual focus of her study remains Targum Zephaniah. Within this focus she aims primarily to find traditions that were preserved in the diaspora (Ho 2009:1), where the Jews adapted to local customs of writing, calligraphy, iconography, decorations of initial letters, the use of colours and so on (Ho 2009:180).

From the various surviving manuscript copies of Targum Zephaniah and the different Aramaic dialects and vernaculars displayed therein, Ho (2009:180) points out how each location reflects a peculiar scribal custom. This information may help to shed light on the history of transmission of Targum Jonathan. In addition, Ho presents a commentary on Targum Zephaniah in which she investigates the characteristics specific to this Aramaic Bible translation. She makes use of social, historical, theological, geographical, and didactic aspects to extrapolate reasons for specific renderings. She compares two different Babylonian manuscripts to discern qualitative changes with regard to time and location; furthermore to establish whether copying activities can be differentiated from each other.

Ho's particular emphasis on exegesis can provide incentives for exegetical

comparisons with other studies of single versions of Targum Minor Prophets. Ho's volume is available in print and e-book format from Brill publications.

Renaud J. Kutty (2010)

Although Kutty's book, *Studies in the Syntax of Targum Jonathan to Samuel* (2010), focusses on the syntax of the Aramaic in the corpus of 1 Samuel and 2 Samuel, his reference to other types of Aramaic together with a detailed comparative discussion of syntactic features may assist researchers to classify the Aramaic dialects used in Targum Minor Prophet. This volume is published by Peeters as part of the Ancient Near Eastern Studies Supplement Series. It is currently available in print and e-book format.

Paul V. M. Flesher and Bruce Chilton (2011)

In their work *The Targums: a critical introduction* (2011), Flesher and Chilton present a survey of critical knowledge and insights of Targum research which emerged over the past sixty years. They show how the exegetical material, additions, and paraphrases in Targums reveal information about Second Temple Judaism, the interpretation of Scripture at the time and what the prevailing beliefs were. Their discussion of the various Targums includes a section on Targum Jonathan of the Prophets (2011:167–228) and specifically how its development is revealed by the Targum of Isaiah. Within this section they give attention to the individual books of the Minor Prophets and identify two additional levels of exegetical interpretation among these. In their analysis, Hosea, Amos, Nahum, Obadiah, Micah, and Zephaniah contain a further development of the exilic theology while Joel, Jonah and Habakkuk move that theology in an individualistic direction.

The value of Flesher and Chilton's contribution lies in their identification of the internal nature of the Targums and their examination of the religious and social contexts. This work may assist researchers to understand the development of the Targums in their relationship to the Hebrew Bible, their redaction, language and function within the history of Judaism, their theology as well as their methods of

interpretation. This volume is available in print and e-book format. It is also part of the Logos Bible Software which dramatically improves the value of this resource through its search functionality, providing links to important concepts from various theologians as well as access to dictionaries, encyclopaedias, and a wealth of other resources in the digital library.

Na ama Pat-El (2012)

The volume *Studies in the historical syntax of Aramaic* by Pat-El (2012) is a valuable source to gain insights for subgrouping Aramaic dialects in Targum Minor Prophets. Moreover, the book's grounding in general linguistics together with its focus on historical syntax makes significant data available for comparative studies of syntactic typology and syntax of Aramaic in single versions of the Minor Prophets. The short overview of Aramaic dialectology which is presented together with its different subdivisions can assist researchers to identify the Aramaic that is particular to a specific Targum in the range of Minor Prophets. Pat-El's book is available from Gorgias Press in the series on Perspectives on Linguistics and Ancient Languages 1 and in e-book format.

A. F. van Zyl (2012)

In an unpublished MA dissertation, "Translation techniques in Malachi according to Targum Jonathan", Van Zyl (2012) compares the Hebrew text of Malachi with its Aramaic rendering in Targum Malachi. Together with Ho's work on Zephaniah (2009), these two studies are currently the only recent comprehensive investigations on single versions of the twelve Targum Minor Prophets apart from Cathcart and Gordon's 1989 translation of *The Targum of the Minor Prophets* from Aramaic into English. Van Zyl's specific focus is on the inherent links between incongruities in the Hebrew text and other obscurities surrounding the Targum Jonathan tradition such as its stages of composition, dating, theology, dependency on other ancient witnesses of the Hebrew Scriptures as well as its life-setting. The study agrees with Churgin (1927) and Flesher (1994) that two types of Aramaic dialect pervade Targum Jonathan,

reflecting a Palestinian and Babylonian period of development. Van Zyl also demonstrates how the dating and dialect are intertwined features in Targum Malachi. These findings suggest that the underlying theology of this Targum reflects a main period of composition which falls into the age of formative Judaism (200–400 C.E.).

Overall, Van Zyl provides additional insight into theological perspectives and tendencies that may have influenced the redaction of the prophetic Targum. The study also contributes towards addressing queries relating to dialect, intertextuality, and translation techniques. The work is available for download in PDF format from the library of the University of Johannesburg.

Journal articles

Since 2003, *Aramaic Studies* (previously *Journal for the Aramaic Bible*) from Brill publications is the major peer-reviewed journal in Targum research. Two recent contributions from the 2013 issue are also relevant for research on Targum Minor Prophets: (i) Stephen A. Kaufman's article (2013:145–148) on "The dialectology of Late Jewish Literary Aramaic", in which he seeks to shed light on the various subdialect groups of Late Jewish Literary Aramaic (LJLA) in the database of the online Comprehensive Aramaic Lexicon Project; and (ii) Margaretha Folmer's study (2013:113–144) on "The translation of Biblical Hebrew clauses with $\text{ܩ} / \text{ܩ} + \text{construct infinitive}$ in Targum Onkelos" which discusses Jewish Aramaic translations of the typical Biblical Hebrew constructions $\text{ܩ} / \text{ܩ} + \text{construct infinitive}$. A contribution by Dmytro V. Tsolin (2012:249–270) on "Elements of rhetoric in the Targums: appeals to the audience" focusses on elements of rhetoric in the Targums, exploring the question of interpolated appeals to the audience and how these appeals were used in translating and expositing certain passages. Tsolin's contribution may be of assistance in view of further research on rhetorical elements in the individual books on Targum Minor Prophets. In a study by Jan-Wim Wesselius (2009:75–83) titled "A note on determination and countability in Targumic Aramaic", he deals with the unexpected occurrence of the determined state (the noun with article in postposition) in the singular in the Aramaic of the classical Targums of Onkelos and Jonathan, as well as

the ending *-ē* to m. pl. nouns. Wesseliuss' proposal that the noun in Targumic Aramaic had, beside absolute, construct, and determined states, a fourth state which can be designated as the uncounted state is an important aspect to consider in any study focussing on individual books of Targum Minor Prophets. The *Aramaic Studies* 2007 to 2010 issues contain updated additions to the *Bibliography of the Aramaic Bible* (2007/1:141–149; 2007/2:263–271; 2008/1:137–143; 2008/2:227–230 ; 2009/1:85–90; 2009/2:189–193; 2010:135–139).

In a recent contribution by Gudrun E. Lier (2015:51–70) on “Translation techniques in Targum Malachi: a comprehensive analysis”, in the *Journal of Northwest Semitic Languages*, incentives can be found for comparative linguistic studies in Targum Minor Prophets.² JSTOR's online database contains a comprehensive list of journal articles for Targum research although a search reveals that not many focussed studies on Targum Minor Prophets have appeared. Journals, which include sporadic contributions to the topic of Targum study, are the *Catholic Biblical Quarterly*, *Currents in Biblical Research*, *European Judaism*, *Jewish Bible Quarterly*, and *Journal for the Study of Judaism: In the Persian Hellenistic & Roman Period*, *Journal for the Study of the Pseudepigrapha*, *Journal of Biblical Literature*, *Religious Studies Review*, *Review of Rabbinic Judaism*, *Theological Studies* and *Vetus Testamentum*.

CONCLUSION

For many years the study of Targum tended merely to serve as a secondary source for the interpretation of biblical and related sources. However, from the 1950s, a change to trends in Targum research can be observed. Scholars began to realise that Targums can shed light on Aramaic dialectology and early Christian interpretation of Scripture.

This review reveals that the individual books of Targum Minor Prophets,

² Lier's published doctoral dissertation (2010) has not been included in this review because its focus is on the Pentateuch Targums. Nonetheless, her discussion of the historical context for Pentateuch Targums (2010:17–80) may serve as an incentive to conduct a similar investigation in view of the historical context for the Targum of the Prophets.

specifically Targumim Hosea, Joel, Amos, Obadiah, Jonah, Micah, Nahum, Habakkuk, Haggai and Zechariah have not yet been explored in detail. Although a broad brush series exists on Targum Minor Prophets, only Targum Zephaniah and Targum Malachi have to date received individual attention.

For any focussed study on an individual book of Targum Minor Prophets, previous research on Targum Jonathan to the Prophets is significant, even if on a broader basis, and can serve as incentive for identifying linguistic and theological trends as well as dependence on and/or correlation with other books in this compendium. Ultimately the goal is to formulate a synthesis of the developmental stages in the redaction history of Targum Jonathan to the Prophets.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

- Accordance [11]. OakTree Software. <http://www.oaksoft.com/>.
- Bacher W 1899. Notes on the critique of the text of the Targum of the Prophets, *The Jewish Quarterly Review* 11/4:651–655.
- BibleWorks [10]. Available: <http://www.bibleworks.com/content/new.html>. [Accessed 2015/10/03].
- Bowker J 2008. *The targums and rabbinic literature*. London: Cambridge University Press.
- Comprehensive Aramaic Lexicon Project. Available: <http://cal1.cn.huc.edu/> [Accessed 2015/10/03]. (CAL)
- Cathcart K J & Gordon R P 1989. *The Targum of the Minor Prophets*. ArBib 14. Collegeville, Minnesota: The Liturgical Press.
- Chilton BD 1987. *The Isaiah Targum: introduction, translation, apparatus and notes*. ArBib 11. Wilmington: Michael Glazier.
- Churgin P 1927. *Targum Jonathan to the Prophets*. YOSR 14. New Haven: Yale University Press.
- Cronin P, Ryan F & Coughlan, M 2008. Undertaking a literature review: a step-by-step approach, *British Journal of Nursing* 17/1:38–43.
- De Moor, J C (ed.) 2006. *Bilingual concordance to the Targum of the Prophets*. 21 vols. Leiden: Brill.
- Joseph, A, Fitzmyer, S J & Kaufman, S A 1992. *An Aramaic bibliography, Part I, Old, Official, and Biblical Aramaic*. Publications of the Comprehensive Aramaic Lexicon Project 1. Baltimore: Johns Hopkins University Press.
- Flesher, P V M & Chilton, B D 2011. *The Targums: a critical introduction*. Waco, Texas: Baylor University Press.
- Folmer, M 2013. The translation of Biblical Hebrew clauses with $\text{א} / \text{א} + \text{Construct Infinitive}$ in Targum Onqelos, *Aramaic Studies* 11/2:113–144.
- Fraade, S D 1985. Targum Jonathan to the Prophets, *The Jewish Quarterly Review* 75/4:392–415.

- Gordon, R P 1974. Sperber's edition of the Targum to the Prophets: a critique, *The Jewish Quarterly Review* 64/4:314.
- _____. 1994. *Studies in the Targum to the Twelve Prophets: From Nahum to Malachi*. VTSup 51. Leiden: Brill.
- Hart, C 2014. *Doing a literature review: releasing the social science research imagination*. Los Angeles: SAGE Publication Ltd.
- Hayward, C T R 1987. *The Targum of Jeremiah*. ArBib 12. Wilmington: Michael Glazier.
- Ho, A 2009. *The Targum of Zephaniah: manuscripts and commentary*. Leiden: Brill.
- Houtman, A & de Moor, J 2005. Introduction to a bilingual concordance to the Targum of the Prophets, Vol 21: Introduction, additions and corrections, indices. Available: <http://www.targum.nl/pdf/BCTP%20introduction.pdf> [Accessed 2015/10/03].
- Kaufman, SA 2013. The dialectology of late Jewish literary Aramaic, *Aramaic Studies* 11/2:145–148.
- Kuty, R 2010. *Studies in the syntax of Targum Jonathan to Samuel*. Ancient Near Eastern Studies Supplement 30. Leuven: Peeters.
- Levey, S H 1987. *The Targum of Ezekiel*. ArBib 13. Wilmington, Delaware: Michael Glazier.
- Lier G E 2010. *A redaction history of the Pentateuch Targums*. New York: Gorgias Press.
- _____. 2015. Translation techniques in Targum Malachi: a comprehensive analysis. *Journal of Northwest Semitic Languages* 41/1:51–70.
- Logos [6]. Comprehensive Aramaic Lexicon 2005. *Targum Jonathan to the Prophets*. Hebrew Union College. Available: <https://www.logos.com/product/7862/the-targums-from-the-files-of-the-comprehensive-aramaic-lexicon-project>.
- Pat-El, N 2012. *Studies in the historical syntax of Aramaic*. Perspectives on Linguistics and Ancient Languages 1. Piscataway, NJ: Gorgias Press.
- Smelik, W 1995. *The Targum of Judges*. Leiden: Brill.
- Smolar, L & Aberbach, M 1983. *Studies in Targum Jonathan to the Prophets*. The Library of Biblical Studies; repr. New York: Ktav Publishing House.
- Sperber, A 1962. *The Latter Prophets according to Targum Jonathan*. Leiden: Brill.
- _____. 1973. *The Targum and the Hebrew Bible*. Leiden: Brill.
- _____. 1992. *The Bible in Aramaic based on old manuscripts and printed texts, I–IVB*. Leiden: Brill.
- Tsolin, D V 2012. Elements of rhetoric in the Targums: Appeals to the Audience, *Aramaic Studies* 10/2:249–270.
- Van Staaldoune-Sulman, E 2002. *The Targum of Samuel*. Leiden: Brill.
- Van Zyl, A F 2012. Translation techniques in Malachi according to Targum Jonathan. Unpublished Master's dissertation. Johannesburg: University of Johannesburg. Available: <https://ujdigispace.uj.ac.za/handle/10210/5377>.
- Wesseliuss, J 2009. A note on determination and countability in Targumic Aramaic, *Aramaic Studies* 7/1:75–83.
- Zemliansky, P 2008. Methods of discovery: A guide to research writing. Available: <http://methodsofdiscovery.net/?q=node/23> [Accessed 2015/05/08].